



Bressay Link

STAG 2

Final Report

May 2008

natural CAPITAL

Report

ZetTrans

Bressay Link STAG 2 Report

May 2008

Bressay STAG Team

c/o ZetTrans

11 Hill Lane

LERWICK

ZE1 0NT

Telephone 01595 744868

Facsimile 01595 744503

Email zettrans@shetland.gov.uk



Report

ZetTrans

Bressay Link STAG 2 Report

For and on behalf of
Natural Capital Ltd.

Approved by: Dr Annie Say

Signed: 

Position: Director

Date: 16 May 2008

This report has been prepared by Natural Capital Ltd. with all reasonable skill, care and diligence within the terms of the Contract with the client, incorporating our General Terms and Conditions of Business and taking account of the resources devoted to it by agreement with the client.

We disclaim any responsibility to the client and others in respect of any matters outside the scope of the above. This report is confidential to the client and we accept no responsibility of whatsoever nature to third parties to whom this report, or any part thereof, is made known. Any such party relies on the report at their own risk.

In line with our company environmental policy we purchase paper for our documents only from suppliers who supply recycled and/or sustainably sourced paper.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.1	PURPOSE OF THE REPORT	1
1.2	BACKGROUND AND HISTORY TO THE STUDY	1
1.3	STUDY AREA	2
1.4	SCOTTISH TRANSPORT APPRAISAL GUIDANCE (STAG)	2
1.5	STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT	3
1.6	SOURCES OF INFORMATION	3
1.7	STRUCTURE OF REPORT	3
2	METHODOLOGY	7
2.1	BRESSAY LINK GROUP	7
2.2	STAGE 1 - ESTABLISHING THE ISSUES, PROBLEMS AND OPPORTUNITIES	7
2.3	STAGE 2 - DEVELOPING PLANNING OBJECTIVES	9
2.4	STAGES 3 AND 4 - OPTION GENERATION AND SIFTING	9
2.5	STAGE 5 - BROAD APPRAISAL	9
2.6	STAGE 6 - DETAILED APPRAISAL	10
2.7	STAGE 7 – REPORTING	10
3	ANALYSIS OF ISSUES, PROBLEMS AND OPPORTUNITIES	11
3.1	CURRENT SERVICE	11
3.2	ISSUES ASSOCIATED WITH THE CURRENT LINK	11
4	OBJECTIVES	15
4.1	GOVERNMENT OBJECTIVES	15
4.2	LOCAL OBJECTIVES	16
5	OPTION GENERATION AND SIFTING OF OPTIONS	21
6	BROAD APPRAISAL	23
6.1	OPTIONS CONSIDERED FOR BROAD APPRAISAL	23
6.2	STAG 1 APPRAISAL SUMMARY TABLES (AST)	24
6.3	CONCLUSIONS FROM BROAD APPRAISAL	25
7	OPTIONS CONSIDERED FOR DETAILED APPRAISAL	27
7.1	INTRODUCTION	27
7.2	APPRAISAL ASSUMPTIONS	27
7.3	OPTION 1 - DRILL AND BLAST TUNNEL	29
7.4	OPTION 2 - HIGH LEVEL BRIDGE	34
7.5	OPTION 3 RECONFIGURED FERRY SERVICE (EXISTING VESSEL/RECONFIGURED FERRY)	38
7.6	OPTION 4 - DO MINIMUM: CURRENT FERRY SERVICE	40
7.7	ALTERNATIVE POWERED FERRIES	41
7.8	PUBLIC TRANSPORT IMPROVEMENTS	42
7.9	PROVISION FOR WALKING AND CYCLING	44
8	ENVIRONMENT	45
8.1	INTRODUCTION	45
8.2	SOURCES OF INFORMATION	45
8.3	CONSULTATION FEEDBACK	45
8.4	APPROACH TO THE APPRAISAL	45
8.5	PLANNING	46
8.6	LAND USE	49
8.7	AGRICULTURE AND SOILS	55
8.8	GEOLOGY	55
8.9	WATER QUALITY, DRAINAGE AND FLOOD DEFENCES	56

8.10	LANDSCAPE	58
8.11	VISUAL AMENITY	59
8.12	BIODIVERSITY	60
8.13	CULTURAL HERITAGE	63
8.14	NOISE AND VIBRATION	64
8.15	AIR QUALITY	66
8.16	ADDITION: IMPROVED PUBLIC TRANSPORT	67
8.17	ENVIRONMENTAL SUMMARY	67
9	SAFETY	73
9.1	INTRODUCTION	73
9.2	SOURCES OF INFORMATION	73
9.3	BASELINE INFORMATION	73
9.4	METHODOLOGY	74
9.5	ACCIDENTS	74
9.6	SECURITY	75
9.7	SUMMARY	76
10	ECONOMY	79
10.1	INTRODUCTION	79
10.2	SOURCES OF INFORMATION	79
10.3	METHODOLOGY	79
10.4	BENEFITS AND COSTS OF TRAVEL OVER BRESSAY SOUND	80
10.5	TRANSPORT ECONOMIC EFFICIENCY (TEE) ANALYSIS	88
10.6	FURTHER SOURCES OF NON-QUANTIFIABLE BENEFITS / COSTS	93
10.7	SENSITIVITY TESTS	93
10.8	TRANSPORT ECONOMIC EFFICIENCY SUMMARY	95
11	ECONOMIC ACTIVITY AND LOCATION IMPACTS	99
11.1	INTRODUCTION	99
11.2	SOURCES OF INFORMATION	100
11.3	STRUCTURE	101
11.4	THE NEED FOR A NEW TRANSPORT SOLUTION	101
11.5	IMPACT OF THE OPTIONS	104
11.6	SUMMARY OF THE IMPACTS OF A FIXED LINK	113
11.7	EVIDENCE OF NEED FOR A NEW TRANSPORT SOLUTION	115
11.8	IMPACT OF THE OPTIONS	116
11.9	SUMMARY CONCLUSION	118
12	ACCESSIBILITY AND SOCIAL INCLUSION	121
12.1	INTRODUCTION	121
12.2	SOURCES OF INFORMATION	121
12.3	BASELINE INFORMATION	121
12.4	METHODOLOGY	122
12.5	COMMUNITY ACCESSIBILITY	123
12.6	COMPARATIVE ACCESSIBILITY	133
12.7	SUMMARY	134
13	INTEGRATION	137
13.1	INTRODUCTION	137
13.2	SOURCES OF INFORMATION	137
13.3	BASELINE INFORMATION	137
13.4	TRANSPORT INTEGRATION	138
13.5	TRANSPORT LAND USE INTEGRATION	142
13.6	POLICY INTEGRATION	142
13.7	SUMMARY	156

14	MONITORING AND EVALUATION	157
14.1	INTRODUCTION	157
15	DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	161
15.1	KEY ISSUES	161
15.2	OBJECTIVES FOR THE STUDY	162
15.3	FINDINGS OF STAG PART 1 APPRAISAL	162
15.4	FINDINGS OF STAG PART 2 APPRAISAL	164
15.5	ENVIRONMENTAL SUMMARY	166
15.6	SAFETY	170
15.7	TRANSPORT ECONOMIC EFFICIENCY	171
15.8	ECONOMIC IMPACT	173
15.9	ACCESSIBILITY	174
15.10	INTEGRATION	174
15.11	DISCUSSION	175
15.12	RECOMMENDATIONS	183

Annex A:	References
Annex B:	Consultation Diary
Annex C:	Bressay Link: First Stage Consultation Report
Annex D:	Bressay Link: STAG Strategic Issues and Objectives Workshop Report
Annex E:	Bressay Link: Option Generation and Initial Appraisal Workshop Report
Annex F:	Bressay Link: STAG 1 - Appraisal Summary Tables (ASTs)
Annex G:	Drill and Blast Tunnel Option
Annex H:	High Level Bridge Option
Annex I:	Reconfigured Ferry Options
Annex J:	Public Transport Options
Annex K:	Economy (Transport Economic Efficiency)
Annex L:	Economic Activity and Location Impacts
Annex M:	STAG 2 – Appraisal Summary Tables (ASTs)
Annex N:	Bressay Link: STAG 2 Findings and Strategic Review Workshop Report

Thanks are extended to everyone who gave up time to assist with this study.

