Consultation Report Regional Transport Strategy

> Shetland Islands Council April 2006

Table of Contents

Executive Summary			
1	Intro	duction	7
	1.1	General Introduction	
	1.2	Consultation Reports	
	1.3	Purpose of Consultation	
	1.4	The Consultation Process	
	1.5	Key Findings	
	1.6	Structure of the Report	
2	Comr		
	2.1	Introduction	
	2.2	Mainland Community Councils	
	2.3	Outer Island Consultation	
	2.4	Other Issues	
3	Stakeholder Consultation		
	3.1	Introduction	
	3.2	Shetland Islands Council and Partner Organisations	
	3.3	Businesses - Transport	
	3.4	Businesses – Seafood	
	3.5	Businesses – Livestock	
	3.6	Public Sector Services	
	3.7	Tourism Sector	
	3.8	Other Businesses	
	3.9	Voluntary Groups	
	3.10	Youth Groups.	
	3.11	Retail Sector	
	3.12	Education	
	3.13	The Elderly	
4	Further Consultation		
	4.1	Introduction	
	4.2	Your Voice Questionnaires	
	4.3	Health Questionnaire	
	4.4	Initiative at the Edge Consultation	
	4.5	Letters to Elected Representatives	
	4.6	Library Van Questionnaire	
	4.7	SIC Website Questionnaires	
	4.8	Have Your Say Discussion Forum	
5	Conc	lusion	
•	5.1	Introduction	
	5.2	External Transport	
	5.3	Inter Island Transport	
	5.4	Internal Transport	
	5.5	Conclusion	
	0.0	Consideration	

Executive Summary

Introduction

This Executive Summary summates the key findings from the consultation process undertaken to inform the development of Shetland's Regional Transport Strategy (RTS).

The consultation process began in October 2005 and continued until February 2006. Consultation meetings were held with all 19 Community Councils in Shetland, the majority of which were open to the public. In addition separate community meetings were held on Fair Isle and Foula to enable the residents of these islands, remote from the main part of their Community Council areas to express their opinions. On Papa Stour, questionnaires were issued to residents in addition to individual meetings held on the island.

Meetings were also held with other key stakeholder groups. These groups included SIC officers, transport providers and hauliers, businesses (including stakeholders from the seafood, livestock, retail, oil, construction and tourism industries), the public sector (e.g. Police, Ambulance, and Fire Services), the health sector, the voluntary sector, schools, young people and the elderly.

In addition to the face-to-face meetings, of which there were just under 100 in total, some further consultation techniques have been applied including reviews of previous research such as the Your Voice questionnaire results, the 2000 NOP Transport Needs Survey, a recent Health Service questionnaire, and outcomes from Initiative at the Edge Workshops. Questionnaires were also issued to users of the Council's library van service, whilst a questionnaire was also posted onto the Council's web page for online completion. A transport related thread was also posted on the "Have Your Say" on-line discussion forum. Letters were also sent to Parliamentary Members inviting their views on the RTS.

Before looking at the main findings from the consultation process, it is to be emphasised that this report provides a snapshot in time of the transport problems, issues and opportunities as perceived by residents and stakeholders of the Shetland Islands. This infers that that the issues raised in this report are those that are very current in the minds of the consultees. As a result, even since the production of this report, developments and policies have come into place that respond to some of the comments raised during consultation, and thus some of the issues contained in this report are no longer as prominent.

It is also to be pointed out that the nature of comments presented in this report are those that focus on transport problems. However, it should be stressed that many of the comments received during consultation were prefaced by a strong acceptance that there are many good transport services in Shetland.

Key Findings

A review of the consultation process has revealed the following key findings.

External Links

On the issue of external links, discussion largely centred on the NorthLink ferry service and the external air service operated from Sumburgh Airport. It is worth mentioning that there was a high level of repetition during consultation on external links, which offers confidence in the results collected.

The nature of comments received on Shetland's external links tended to fit into the themes identified below.

Cost – A continual theme across the whole of the consultation exercise was the recurring issue of the high cost of transport to the Scottish Mainland, be it for freight, or for passengers. This was most frequently mentioned in relation to passenger air trips. The recent announcement of subsidised islander air fares was made after completion of the consultation exercise. The wide range of air fares, and the perceived unpredictability in fare levels was also frequently mentioned.

The total costs of taking a car, family and cabin on the NorthLink service was also frequently raised, whilst it was recognised that single passenger fares, without a berth, were quite affordable. High costs for freight were also highlighted, although it was recognised that the new ferry tender would feature a freight subsidy.

Capacity – Another universal comment was the difficultly of making a cabin booking on the NorthLink service during busy periods. Whilst recognising higher standards of service, and an improved timetable, the lack of cabin space was an issue causing specific comment that could constrain tourism opportunities.

Accessibility of Ports and Airports – The lack of adequate long stay parking arrangements for the NorthLink service in Lerwick was frequently mentioned, as was the lack of short stay parking arrangements for the terminal in Aberdeen. At Sumburgh, the lack of available car parking was frequently highlighted. However, at Sumburgh, the perception that there is a lack of co-ordination between bus times and aircraft arrivals and departures was specifically and frequently highlighted.

Future mainland port – Throughout the consultation period, there was consistent debate surrounding the desirability of continuing to have the Mainland Port in Aberdeen for all, or some of the passenger or freight connections. Alternative ports highlighted included Peterhead, Tayside, or Rosyth. There were many strongly held views on the situation, although there was no clear consensus. This perhaps reflects the broad range of users, both freight and passengers, using the service.

The end of the consultation period coincided with the consideration of a report discussing the possibility of introducing larger combined passenger and freight services onto the route.

Reasons for a preference for an alternative port came from the desire to see more direct freight links to the central belt, the ability to attract more tourists to Shetland, a possible link to the European ferry at Rosyth, and the perceived restrictions on larger vessels at Aberdeen.

Reasons against alternative ports were based around the suitability of Aberdeen with onward access to rail, air and coach connections, good links to the city centre, established health and social links, the fact that from Aberdeen passenger numbers had soared, and the fact that alternative harbour berths in Aberdeen could accommodate larger ferries.

Some consultees highlighted the need for further quantified information on passenger and freight trip origin and destinations, delays and disruptions, as well as an appraisal of possible future service options including vessel/fleet sizes and configurations prior to being able to provide a view on this issue.

Inter-Island Links

Discussions in reference to inter-island links revolved around the life-line role that the interislands air and ferry services play in sustaining Shetland's outer isles. The sections below summate the main findings related to the inter-island transport services. **Sustainability of remote islands** – A recurring issue for outer islands was the role that transport services played in ensuring the continued vitality and viability of each island. This issue was perhaps most acute on the most remote islands (such as Foula, Fair Isle, Papa Stour, Skerries, Unst and Fetlar), but was also a feature of discussions on Yell, Whalsay and Bressay.

It was recognised that a secure and long-term commitment was required from the Council for supporting transport links by ferry and (where appropriate) air, whilst acknowledging that other factors (such as education, access to health, employment opportunities, housing, and community strength) were also vitally important.

Ferry Links – A recurrent issue was the desire for the ferry service to be as responsive and as reliable as possible, noting the constraints imposed by the weather. This was translated into a desire, where at all practical, for the ferry crews and ferry to be based on each island being served, supported, where appropriate, with the necessary infrastructure. It was felt that this would bring the benefits of jobs, and also the ability to respond more readily to changing weather conditions, and a willingness by the ferry crew to be more flexible to community needs.

There were common desires for infrastructure improvements and investment which it was hoped would help to reduce the unreliability caused by weather patterns, particularly at Skerries and Fetlar. It was felt by the communities that this had been previously promised, but not yet delivered.

Furthermore, in relation to Whalsay, there was a strong desire to see continued progress in the development of replacement terminals, and ferries.

Fixed links – Consultation revealed an almost universal willingness to pursue a fixed link (tunnel) between Yell and Unst. The desirability of a link between Yell and Shetland Mainland was frequently mentioned, but the Yell CC thought the local community was split on the issue.

Inter-islands air service – The value of the inter-islands air service was frequently highlighted, and there was particularly strong support and appreciation of the current pilots and operators. The possibility of additional flights for Fair Isle during the peak season, and additional flights to improve island accessibility (i.e. day trip opportunities for islanders) was a frequent desire. The taxi-bus service to the airport was particularly well received.

• Internal Transport

Discussion on internal transport issues identified a wide variety of comments related to walking and cycling facilities, public transport accessibility as well as road safety and road maintenance issues. Many of the comments received were operational issues such as specific junctions that require improvements and particular areas where there are missing footpaths, for example. These issues are locally important, but less appropriate for the RTS. Therefore, the sections below attempt to summarise the main 'type' of issues identified through consultation on internal transport.

Walking/verges – The majority of communities consulted mentioned the constraint on walking due to the existing configuration of single track roads plus either deep ditches, or high verges. This was perceived as making walking dangerous, and unsuitable. There was a common desire for the development of rural style footpaths providing pedestrian links to key locations.

Public transport issues – Many aspects of the public transport service were appreciated. However, it was recognised that the existing public transport network primarily serves "9 to 5" workers in Lerwick, as well as day time shopper services. Night and evening services, more frequent links during the daytime, and services appropriate for trips to local shops/services were highlighted – however, it was realised that the cost and feasibility of providing this, against the numbers who would use the service and benefit would not always be balanced. There was some interest in supporting demand responsive and community transport schemes as a way of meeting the demand in a cost effective manner.

Road safety – Many consultees noted the perceived high levels of road traffic accidents in Shetland, with combinations of speed, drink and inappropriate driving behaviour most frequently mentioned. It was noted that the spine roads frequently experienced high driver speeds.

Road connections – Consultees noted that the level of road infrastructure was probably unrivalled throughout much of Scotland. However, it was noted that roads in the West Side, and North of Hillswick junction were of a poorer standard than elsewhere on the island. Consultees also highlighted the need to review the safety and layout of a number of the junctions on the Lerwick to Sumburgh route, particularly at Gulberwick, Quarff, Sandwick and Levenwick.

• Other Issues

In addition to the above, some wider issues were raised during consultation including concerns over the future cost and supply of fuel, the links between transport and wider economic development, and how transport should act to centralise or, in contrast, decentralise jobs and services in Shetland.

Conclusion

In closing, the consultation process has proved invaluable in identifying current issues, problems and opportunities that the RTS must address. It is believed that the extensive nature of the consultation process has allowed for a strong base of information to be gathered, and places the RTS in a strong position moving forward. Another benefit of the consultation process is that it has allowed for stakeholder buy-in to the RTS, and it is essential that there is a strong perception of local responsibility for the RTS if it is to be developed and implemented effectively.

1 Introduction

1.1 General Introduction

This report provides results from the consultation process undertaken by Faber Maunsell on behalf of Shetland Islands Council (SIC), designed to inform the development of Shetland's Regional Transport Strategy (RTS).

It provides a snapshot in time of the transport problems, issues and opportunities as perceived by residents and stakeholders of the Shetland Islands. It should be emphasised that the issues raised in this report are those that are very current in the minds of the consultees. As a result, even since the production of this report, developments and policies have come into place that respond to some of the comments raised during consultation, and thus some of the issues contained in this report are no longer as prominent.

It is also to be pointed out that the nature of comments presented in this report are those that focus on transport problems. However, it should be stressed that many of the comments received during consultation were prefaced by a strong acceptance that there are many good transport services in Shetland.

1.2 Consultation Reports

The consultation process had been recorded in three complementary reports, as set out below.

- Consultation Report
- Community Consultation Annex
- Stakeholder Consultation Annex

This Report acts as a summary outlining the main findings from the consultation process as a whole, detailing the range of consultation exercises used. The supporting annexes provide full and detailed minutes of each of the meetings undertaken during the consultation process.

1.3 Purpose of Consultation

The aim of the consultation process was to identify key issues, problems and opportunities that should be addressed within the RTS, with specific regards to the three main transport themes in Shetland:

- External Transport;
- Inter-Island Transport; and
- Internal Transport.

The consultation process has taken a *qualitative* rather than *quantitative* approach, with the focus concentrated on the identification of key issues. The consultation report is one element that will inform the development of the Strategy's Objectives and Options.

1.4 The Consultation Process

The consultation process began in October 2005 and continued until February 2006. Consultation meetings were held with all 19 Community Councils in Shetland, the majority of which were open to the public. In addition separate community meetings were held on Fair Isle

and Foula to enable the residents of these islands, remote from the main part of their Community Council areas to be able to express their opinions. On Papa Stour, questionnaires were issued to residents. In addition, residents were able to request individual meetings, and two households accepted this invitation. As indicated, a more comprehensive set of notes on the community consultation meetings is provided in the Community Consultation Report.

Meetings were also held with other key stakeholders. These groups included SIC officers, transport providers and hauliers, businesses (including stakeholders from the seafood, livestock, retail, oil, construction and tourism industries), the public sector (eg Police, Ambulance, Fire Service, Royal Mail), the health sector, the voluntary sector, schools, young people and the elderly. The Stakeholder Consultation Annex offers a more comprehensive listing of the minutes from meetings with these groups.

A list showing all of the meetings that have taken place as part of the consultation process is shown in Appendix A.

In addition to the face-to-face meetings, of which there were just under 100 in total, some further consultation techniques have been applied. This has included a review of previous community opinion surveys (Your Voice, and the 2000 NOP Transport Needs Survey), a recent Health Service questionnaire, outcomes from the recent Initiative at the Edge Workshops, letters to Parliamentary Members, Questionnaires issued to users of the library van service, responses from the council's web page, and a review of transport related threads on the "Have Your Say" on-line discussion forum.

1.5 Key Findings

A review of the consultation responses has revealed the following key issues arising from the consultation.

1.5.1 External Links

Cost – A continual theme across the whole of the consultation exercise was the recurring issue of the high cost of transport to the Scottish Mainland, be it for freight, or for passengers. This was most frequently mentioned in relation to passenger air trips. The recent announcement of subsidised islander air fares was made after completion of the consultation exercise. The wide range of air fares, and the perceived unpredictability in fare levels was also frequently mentioned.

The total costs of taking a car, family and cabin on the NorthLink service was also frequently raised, whilst it was recognised that single passenger fares, without a berth, were quite affordable. High costs for freight were also highlighted, although it was recognised that the new ferry tender would feature a freight subsidy.

Capacity – Another universal comment was the difficultly of making a cabin booking on the NorthLink service during busy periods. Whilst recognising higher standards of service, and an improved timetable, the lack of cabin space was an issue causing specific comment that could constrain tourism opportunities.

Accessibility of Ports and Airports – The lack of adequate long stay parking arrangements for the NorthLink service in Lerwick was frequently mentioned, as was the lack of short stay parking arrangements for the terminal in Aberdeen. At Sumburgh, the lack of available car parking was frequently highlighted. However, at Sumburgh, the perception that there is a lack of co-ordination between bus times and aircraft arrivals and departures was specifically and frequently highlighted.

Future mainland port – Throughout the consultation period, there was consistent debate surrounding the desirability of continuing to have the Mainland Port in Aberdeen for all, or some of the passenger or freight connections. Alternative ports highlighted included Peterhead, Tayside, or Rosyth. There were many strongly held views on the situation, although there was

no clear consensus. This perhaps reflects the broad range of users, both freight and passengers, using the service.

The end of the consultation period coincided with the consideration of a report discussing the possibility of introducing larger combined passenger and freight services onto the route.

Reasons for a preference for an alternative port came from the desire to see more direct freight links to the central belt, the ability to attract more tourists to Shetland, a possible link to the European ferry at Rosyth, and the perceived restrictions on larger vessels at Aberdeen.

Reasons against alternative ports were based around the suitability of Aberdeen with onward access to rail, air and coach connections, good links to the city centre, established health and social links, the fact that from Aberdeen passenger numbers had soared, and the fact that alternative harbour berths in Aberdeen could accommodate larger ferries.

Some consultees highlighted the need for further quantified information on passenger and freight trip origin and destinations, delays and disruptions, as well as an appraisal of possible future service options including vessel/fleet sizes and configurations prior to being able to provide a view on this issue.

1.5.2 Inter-Island Links

Sustainability of remote islands – A recurring issue for outer islands was the role that transport services played in ensuring the continued vitality and viability of each island. This issue was perhaps most acute on the most remote islands (such as Foula, Fair Isle, Papa Stour, Skerries, Unst and Fetlar), but was also a feature of discussions on Yell, Whalsay and Bressay.

It was recognised that a secure and long-term commitment was required from the Council for supporting transport links by ferry and (where appropriate) air, whilst acknowledging that other factors (such as education, access to health, employment opportunities, housing, and community strength) were also vitally important.

Ferry Links – A recurrent issue was the desire for the ferry service to be as responsive and as reliable as possible, noting the constraints imposed by the weather. This was translated into a desire, where at all practical, for the ferry crews and ferry to be based on each island being served, supported, where appropriate, with the necessary infrastructure. It was felt that this would bring the benefits of jobs, and also the ability to respond more readily to changing weather conditions, and a willingness by the ferry crew to be more flexible to community needs.

There were common desires for infrastructure improvements and investment which it was hoped would help to reduce the unreliability caused by weather patterns, particularly at Skerries and Fetlar. It was felt by the communities that this had been previously promised, but not yet delivered.

Furthermore, in relation to Whalsay, there was a strong desire to see continued progress in the development of replacement terminals, and ferries.

Fixed links – Consultation revealed an almost universal willingness to pursue a fixed link (tunnel) between Yell and Unst. The desirability of a link between Yell and Shetland Mainland was frequently mentioned, but the Yell CC thought the local community was split on the issue.

Inter-islands air service – The value of the inter-islands air service was frequently highlighted, and there was particularly strong support and appreciation of the current pilots and operators. The possibility of additional flights for Fair Isle during the peak season, and additional flights to improve island accessibility (i.e. day trip opportunities for islanders) was a frequent desire. The taxi-bus service to the airport was particularly well received.

1.5.3 Internal Transport

Walking/verges – The majority of communities consulted mentioned the constraint on walking due to the existing configuration of single track roads plus either deep ditches, or high verges.

This was perceived as making walking dangerous, and unsuitable. There was a common desire for the development of rural style footpaths providing pedestrian links to key locations.

Public transport issues – Many aspects of the public transport service were appreciated. However, it was recognised that the existing public transport network primarily serves "9 to 5" workers in Lerwick, as well as day time shopper services. Night and evening services, more frequent links during the daytime, and services appropriate for trips to local shops/services were highlighted – however, it was realised that the cost and feasibility of providing this, against the numbers who would use the service and benefit would not always be balanced. There was some interest in supporting demand responsive and community transport schemes as a way of meeting the demand in a cost effective manner.

Road safety – Many consultees noted the perceived high levels of road traffic accidents in Shetland, with combinations of speed, drink and inappropriate driving behaviour most frequently mentioned. It was noted that the spine roads frequently experienced high driver speeds.

Road connections – Consultees noted that the level of road infrastructure was probably unrivalled throughout much of Scotland. However, it was noted that roads in the West Side, and North of Hillswick junction were of a poorer standard than elsewhere on the island. Consultees also highlighted the need to review the safety and layout of a number of the junctions on the Lerwick to Sumburgh route, particularly at Gulberwick, Quarff, Sandwick and Levenwick.

1.5.4 Some Wider Issues

Some wider issues were also raised during consultation including concerns over the future cost and supply of fuel, the links between transport and wider economic development, and how transport should act to centralise or, in contrast, decentralise jobs and services in Shetland.

1.5.5 Operational Issues

In addition to the above, the consultation programme revealed a whole host of more operational concerns. Issues such as specific junctions that require improvements and particular areas where there are missing footpaths, for example, are locally important, but less appropriate for the RTS. Appendix B provides a full list of the problems and suggested improvements raised during the consultation, and therefore includes some of the more frequently mentioned operational issues arising from the consultation.

1.6 Structure of the Report

Following this introductory section this report proceeds as follows:

- Section 2, Community Council Consultation
- Section 3, Stakeholder Consultation
- Section 4, Further Consultation
- Section 5, Summary and Conclusion

A series of appendices also support this report, including:

- Appendix A Consultation Checklist
- Appendix B Problems and Opportunities Matrix
- Appendix C Survey Results (Comparison of Your Voice 2005 and NOP 2000 surveys)

- Appendix D Letter to Parliamentary Representatives
- Appendix E Library Van Questionnaire
- Appendix F SIC website Questionnaire

2 Community Council Consultation

2.1 Introduction

This section of the report offers the main results of the Community Council consultations. In addition to members of the Community Councils, the local SIC Councillors were also invited to the meeting of the area that they represent. At some meetings, members of the public were also invited.

The results from the Community Council consultations have been subdivided relating to geographical area. The results are summarised relating to the external, inter-island and internal transport issues in terms of key problems and issues, and measures that people would like to see adopted. In the latter sections relating to the outer isles in Shetland, only those points that are additional to those previously made are provided in this report. Full minutes of all the consultations are provided in the supporting Community Consultation Annex.

2.2 Mainland Community Councils

2.2.1 External Links

Discussion tended to fit around three main topics related to external links:

- Shetland's external air service to the Scottish Mainland;
- The NorthLink ferry service; and
- The Smyril Line ferry service.

2.2.1.1 Air Service

At every community consultation meeting, the high cost of flights to and from Shetland was raised as a problem. There was an understanding that these high flight costs are due to a lack of competition from other airlines at Sumburgh Airport. As a result, many respondents called for the introduction of PSO's on flights to and from Sumburgh in order to make the route more competitive.

The range of flight costs and the considerable disparity between the highest and lowest costs was also highlighted as a major problem by many of the Community Council representatives, with some comparing the booking of flights "like playing the lottery". In light of this, many would like to see the introduction of one standard fare as this would make it easier to plan and budget for trips away. Numerous examples were stated where Shetlanders have had to leave the island in a hurry in order to make appointments on Scotland Mainland (i.e. funerals), but because they have had to book at such short notice, they have had to pay top prices for tickets.

The criticism was also raised that Loganair are very inflexible when it comes to refunds for tickets that are not used.

Regarding the timetable of flights to and from Shetland, the recent increase in frequency, albeit with smaller aircrafts, was welcomed and viewed as an improved service to that of the past. In particular, it was felt that the frequency of flights to Aberdeen was good, whilst the improved frequency of flights that enables travel to Edinburgh and back to Shetland in the same day was much welcomed. It is thought that Inverness should be the next destination that a daily return service is extended to.

There was also strong support for the introduction of the Atlantic Airways flights to London and the Faroe Islands, which it is hoped can prove viable and encourage other air operators to enter the Shetland market.

Despite the increased frequency of flights, there were still some concerns related to the size of planes at Sumburgh Airport and the operating hours of the airport. For example, concern was expressed about the size of the Loganair Saab 340 planes, in that some perceived that they were not big enough to accommodate all the demand. It was suggested that a larger 50 seat aircraft is leased during the summer months to cope with the increased number of people travelling during this period. The baggage allowance on Loganair flights was also said to be limiting as it is less than that given on other parts of the British Airways network. There is also believed to be a lack of overhead locker room.

Furthermore, it was reminded that flights are susceptible to delay or cancellation in times of bad weather or for technical reasons. When planes are cancelled, the service provided by Loganair in terms of looking after their passengers is not good, with no hotel provision, meals or travel back home provided according to respondents. On the whole, however, there appeared to be an acceptance that the weather is a big problem in Shetland and there is little that can be done about this.

Another problem related to the air service is that Sumburgh Airport's operating hours are constrained by HIAL, as if the airport's opening hours were extended, HIAL would have to make the decision to employ more staff. The airport cannot have planes landing or taking off before 7.30am. Flights from Aberdeen that arrive early are forced to circle overhead until they can land. Early morning travel times are considered to be inconvenient for those travelling from Aberdeen to Sumburgh. Extending the opening hours of the airport was seen as a potentially beneficial step to rectify this. Car parking was also cited as a problem at Sumburgh Airport, although it was accepted that there are parking problems at every airport.

Other comments relating to the air service, more prominent in those Community Councils located in the northern parts of Shetland, was the use of other airports as Shetland's main airport. The view was expressed that Scatsta would make a better main airport for Shetland and should at least be used as a diversionary airport for flights that cannot land in Sumburgh. Concerns over global warming and rising sea levels were also used to question the decision to extend the runway at Sumburgh Airport. It was also thought that the operator of Scatsta airport should be able to offer cheap flights to the airport. Others considered that Tingwall would make a better main airport than Sumburgh. However, on the whole, support was expressed for the extension of the runway at Sumburgh and it had gradually been accepted that Sumburgh is Shetland's main airport given the development of the runway.

2.2.1.2 NorthLink Service

The major problem raised in relation to the NorthLink ferries was that there are not enough cabins on board for people. Possible suggestions to increase the capacity of the ferries were offered, including the removal of the cinema and bar areas to provide more cabins, adjustment of travel times on the NorthLink ferries and operation of shuttle runs to reduce the time spent in harbour. It was also thought that Shetland should have its own ferry service to Aberdeen as NorthLink are trying to run two services in one by sailing to Orkney as well as Shetland.

Linked to the above, there are believed to be problems related to the booking of cabins on the NorthLink ferries. For example, some people questioned why it can be cheaper for two people to book a four berth inside cabin than a two berth outside cabin. When people do this they are depriving others of berths.

With regards to the NorthLink timetable, there was support for the later sailings, although some people raised their dissatisfaction at the variable times that the ferry leaves Lerwick on different evenings. It was said to be inconvenient that the ferry leaves earlier to travel to Orkney on some evenings before sailing to Aberdeen.

Some more specific problems were highlighted with regards to the NorthLink service, including that for people who travel without a cabin, there are no showers. There is also severe dislike to the lack of left luggage facilities for NorthLink passengers in Aberdeen. Parking problems at

Aberdeen Harbour were also noted and it was stated that a short term car parking area in Aberdeen to leave a car while waiting to board the ferry would be desirable. Furthermore it was said that Mainland UK travel agencies can have difficulties in booking passengers onto the ferries, particularly in trying to access Islander fares.

Despite the above constraints, it was generally recognised that the NorthLink ferries offer an improved service to the previous P&O ferries and that the capacity constraints reflect the fact that NorthLink has been a victim of its own success. It was also suggested that it can be very cheap to travel by ferry for groups of young people and students, if reclining chairs are booked - although the reclining chairs were said to be uncomfortable.

Discussion also centred on the future Mainland port destination for the NorthLink ferries, particularly in light of reports suggesting that it could be more efficient to run two larger vessels to ports other than Aberdeen.

It was noted that Aberdeen had some advantages: shorter crossing than Rosyth, easy access to town centre, strong cultural connections, easy access to rail, coach and air links. Recent growth on the route could confirm its suitability.

Disadvantages of Aberdeen were the size of its berth which could limit the length of alternative ferries, and some delays due to tidal conditions/prevailing north-easterly winds.

Advantages of alternative ports were the ability to provide berths for larger vessels, and if located to the south of Aberdeen, easier access to the central belt. A link to Rosyth could provide some connections with the Superfast ferry to Zeebrugge.

Disadvantages with alternative ports were mainly poorer access than Aberdeen for public transport, town centres, and (for Peterhead) poorer road access.

The prevailing view from the community councils was that, on balance, Aberdeen should be retained as Mainland port, whilst there was a desire to see the pros and cons of other arrangements considered.

2.2.1.3 Smyril Line Service

The Smyril Line service was seen as a good thing in terms of bringing tourism to Shetland and in strengthening Shetland's links to its Scandinavian neighbours. Consequently there was disappointment that the Smyril Line would no longer be calling into Lerwick during the winter period. It was stated that a small freight vessel between Lerwick and Scandinavia should be provided to cover this period. There was concern regarding this lack of contingency in the Smyril Line service and that Shetland could lose this link in the future because of this.

Others were sceptical of the benefits of the Smyril Line service and questioned the media reports that SIC were prepared to inject a significant level of funding into this service which employs very few if any local people and does not berth in Lerwick long enough to have any major economic impact.

2.2.2 Inter-Island Links

On the whole, discussion on inter-islands links was limited during the Mainland Community Council meetings. The majority of views related to the costs of maintaining these links and sustaining rural communities, as highlighted below.

2.2.2.1 Inter-islands Ferry Service

The view was expressed that the inter island ferries are too expensive to run in terms of the running costs and the replacement costs. Some also thought that the ticket prices are too high, whilst others recognised that compared to other areas in Scotland fare levels were very favourable. Support was offered for the development of fixed links, particularly to Unst and Yell in the Northern Isles. It was also suggested that if fixed links are going to be built then they should not take as long to implement as the proposed Bressay Bridge. Tunnels are favoured over bridges, and some thought that the Bressay Bridge should be abandoned in favour of a tunnel.

Whilst some criticised the level of subsidy that went into sustaining some of the small isles of Shetland, others were aware that in the same way some Shetland Mainland residents view the isles as just periphery isles that are being over-subsidised, the same view could be held of Shetland as a whole by people on Scotland Mainland

It was proposed that better use could be made of the electronic signs at ferry terminals and that they could display positive messages to encourage people to visit the outer isles. It was suggested that there should also be improved waiting rooms, cafes and better information at all ferry terminals.

2.2.2.2 Inter-islands Air Service

It was thought that there is a need to safeguard the inter island air services as they are vital to outlying communities. The flexible attitude of pilots to the timetables was commended as was the pro-active approach taken to support the islands. There was support for the recent drop in air fares, and flight costs are now believed to be quite reasonable.

2.2.3 Internal Links

Discussion on internal transport has focussed on a wide range of issues including walking and cycling facilities, adequacy of public transport services and measures to address road safety concerns. As alluded to earlier, many of the local issues discussed were operational in nature and do not fit within the strategic approach adopted for the RTS. Nevertheless, these technical issues are important and have been included in the Problems and Opportunities Matrix in Appendix B.

2.2.3.1 Walking and Cycling

The main issue with regards to walking related to the lack of pedestrian footpaths in rural areas. Whilst it was accepted that it is not possible to provide full tarmac footpaths throughout Shetland, and nor would this be welcomed, there was support for the implementation of a basic hard surface or 'French drain' in rural areas so to provide walkers with a safe pedestrian refuge on a surface that retains the rural feel of the area.

Cycling in Lerwick is considered to be dangerous and it was pointed out that there is a need to increase driver awareness of cyclists.

Within Lerwick, it was perceived that there is too much congestion around schools with parents dropping off and picking up their children and thus there should be more encouragement for parents and pupils to walk or cycle to school. There was widespread support for the imposition of 20mph zones around schools, although it is also felt that these limits will not be adhered to without appropriate physical traffic calming measures.

2.2.3.2 Public Transport

First, it should be stated that there was an acknowledgment that it is very difficult to provide public transport in Shetland given the Shetlands' dispersed population pattern. It was also recognised that Shetland has a far greater public transport service than other areas in Scotland Mainland with similar population sizes. However, numerous examples were highlighted where buses do not serve the needs of the local population or where buses only suit the requirements of "9 to 5" workers in Lerwick.

A widespread comment was that there is a need for more evening, late night and weekend buses. Drink-driving was considered to be a particularly significant problem in Shetland and it is felt that the provision of late night buses could help alleviate this problem. The cost of taxis was felt to be too high for transport to rural areas. There was support for the shopper's services that have been implemented across Shetland and an extension to the shopper's bus network was thought to be a good idea. There was little comment on the cost of fares, although it was suggested that should Shetland get to the point where times and frequencies of buses improve, a day ticket should be introduced.

Whilst school transport is believed to be a good and comprehensive service, it was highlighted as a problem that school transport does not serve the after school clubs and thus some children miss out. Concerns were also raised over the limited bus service that operates to some health centres, particularly the health centre in Levenwick.

The need for better integration between bus timetables was also suggested, particularly the bus timetables between the north and south of Mainland Shetland. It was also recommended that flight operators should reintroduce free minibuses home if flights are late in landing.

Other comments included that more consideration should be given to tourists when planning bus routes as not all people travelling to Shetland have a car, and in general there is poor provision for those without access to a car. It is thought that bus services for tourists to get to tourist attractions that are located out of the way would be beneficial. Some questions were raised over the suitability of buses used on cross country routes. Some consultees considered that the ride quality of the buses is low, with slidey seats, no hand rails and lack of luggage space.

It was advised that SIC monitor all bus stops to make sure that they all have an up to date timetable and a map. There is support for the use of solar panels at bus stops, provided that they are installed and maintained correctly.

2.2.3.3 Roads and Road Safety

On the whole, the quality and standard of roads in Shetland were believed to be excellent, especially when compared to the road condition on some roads in Scotland Mainland. However, specific locations where it is felt roads require to be improved were highlighted including roads on the west side of Shetland, and the road to North Roe. It was also said that the road surface in Lerwick is in a poorer state than anywhere else in Shetland, and there is a lack of coordination over the digging up of roads in Shetland.

A number of consultees highlighted a lack of parking in Lerwick as a problem, particularly at the Holmsgarth ferry terminal and Victoria Pier.

SIC's winter maintenance programme is believed to be an extremely good service according to most consultees, although there were some specific areas where there were complaints that the gritting is not done early enough in the morning.

Regarding road safety, there was said to be a problem with drivers speeding in Lerwick. The layout and design of some roads appeared to encourage speeding. The Spine Road was highlighted as particularly bad for this. Specific junctions and blind stretches of road were also highlighted as areas in need of improvement, particularly between Lerwick and Sumburgh. Reduced speed limits in specific areas were also recommended, such as through Brae and Mossbank. Specific areas where there is a need for extra lighting to improve road safety were also highlighted.

On a wider issue, there is a growing concern over the rising costs of fuels, and subsequently it was suggested that SIC push for differential fuel taxation.

2.3 Outer Island Consultation

The sections above generally cover the key transport issues in Shetland. These broad issues outlined above, such as the concerns over the cost of external flights, the lack of capacity on the NorthLink services and some local issues regarding verge maintenance etc, are equally representative of the results gained through discussion on each of Shetland's outer isles. Therefore, rather than simply duplicate or repeat the above discussions, the following sections will concentrate on the more specific transport problems and opportunities unique to each of the island communities in Shetland.

2.3.1 Yell

Regarding external links, given the long distances required to travel to Sumburgh Airport for people in the North Isles, Scatsta would be a more suitable airport than Sumburgh. However, it is generally accepted that given the recent investment in Sumburgh, this will be the main airport in the long-term.

In terms of the inter-islands links, it is believed that the ferry service from Yell to Shetland Mainland is excellent as there are no problems booking onto the ferry. Although there is a reduced frequency of service, the fact ferry users are now assured of a place on the ferry was said to more than compensate for the reduced frequency. Regarding the provision of transport information, it was stated that the voicebank and VMS signs related to the ferries are very useful but only if kept up to date.

Concerns were raised if ever the ferry contract was to go out to tender, as it is feared that this could result in a rise in fares and may lead to cheaper labour coming in to replace local ferry jobs. The principal cost of operating the ferries are running cost and labour costs – so there is believed to be a risk to local crews if the ferry service was tendered and operated by another company.

When Yell first got a ro-ro service approximately 30 years ago, the Community Council thought then that fares would be low enough as to allow people to commute. Now it is thought that increasing costs would be detrimental to the North Isles and could actually see the island depopulating. Yell has a compact economy and any change affects the whole economy. Therefore, there would be strong opposition to increases in ferry fares. Support was expressed for the removal of the fares on the Bluemull Sound and there were calls for this to be extended onto the Yell Sound services as well.

Regarding fixed links, it was believed that there is a mixed feeling ("50-50") towards the potential for a fixed link from Yell to Shetland Mainland and that a survey is required first. The negative impacts of a fixed link were recognised, as it was stated that Burra and Trondra had a much stronger community spirit prior to the building of bridges.

Similar to the Mainland Community Councils, internal transport provision in terms of road quality and maintenance was said to be good on Yell. There was support for the integrated public transport service that operates from Fetlar, Unst and Yell to Lerwick, as well as the dial-a-ride services that operate on the island.

Unst

2.3.2

Similar to the problems outlined above, living in Unst makes it impossible to catch the early flights from Sumburgh.

Some particular areas of concern were raised in relation to inter-islands transport including that there is only one ferry operational during the weekend, which presents difficulties when it is servicing Fetlar. Concern was also raised that a full timetable is only provided three days a week, and that the Bluemull and Yell services did not link up very well during the festive season. It was also said that the timetable can be confusing. The desire for an Unst based ferry crew was also raised.

A further concern surrounded capacity problems on the Bluemull Sound at peak times and during events. It was also said that the ferry constrains tourism opportunities during the summer peaks. Consequently, some form of park and ride was suggested for tourists, whilst a lift share scheme was suggested for any commuters using the ferry.

Given some of the constraints highlighted above, there is a desire for the progression of fixed links between Yell and Unst. It was stated that no private businesses on Unst benefit from the ferry and fixed links are believed to provide a solution that would help to retain younger members of the community on the island.

With regards to internal transport, an earlier commuter bus service from Unst has previously been considered and it was suggested that this could be trialled if sufficient demand could be demonstrated.

2.3.3 Fetlar

The main transport concern in Fetlar relates to the ferry to Yell. At the weekend only one ferry operates on the route, and as such there can be a long time delay between sailings. It was believed that this discourages potential weekend visitors to the island who would be limited by a lack of options for getting back off the island. It was suggested that a second ferry would be required to operate on this route. Concerns were also raised about the timing of some of the sailings to Fetlar.

The lack of a breakwater at Hamars Ness was also said to be a major factor in the ferry service. The original plans for the ferry terminal showed there to be provision for a breakwater. This was later removed for reasons that were not made clear to the residents on the island. It was however assumed that these were for budgetary reasons. The reason for moving the terminal from its previous position to Hamars Ness was that it was thought that fewer ferries would be cancelled, although this has not been the case. It was however considered that this may be due to weather conditions that are different from the norm. In the instances that ferries are cancelled there are very few places for people to stay on Yell. People are usually forced to stay with either friends or relatives, if available. It was felt that when this happens there should be more help available to provide people with accommodation and information about what's happening.

With regard to the removal of fares on the ferry to Yell, this was considered a positive move, but concern exists that as this will cost SIC approximately £250,000 annually, this will result in there being no provision for a breakwater.

The possibility of a fixed link between Yell and Unst was considered to be a good thing by the people of Fetlar as this may mean that they would get a better ferry service, and an increased possibility of the ferry being based on Fetlar. A further improvement could be the stationing of a ferry permanently on Fetlar.

The possibility of an air link to Fetlar was considered to be good, but there was doubt as to how much it would be used.

There is a taxi based on the island that belongs to RJ Jamieson and is used to ferry school children from around the island to the school. It was suggested that it would be beneficial if this could be used to offer a dial a ride service during the rest of the day in order to transport people to the terminal at Hamers Ness.

The difficulties of arranging health appointments to coincide with the timings of public transport were also noted. One significant gap in the transport provision is for those people trying to get to Mid Yell, which is where the local doctor and dentist are based

2.3.4 Whalsay

Although a meeting was held with Whalsay Community Council, residents of Whalsay have recently been the subject of extensive consultation on options to provide an improved link to the island either via improved vessels, improved terminals or a fixed link. The results from this consultation have been used for the purposes of the RTS.

The consultation exercises revealed that the vast majority of the population are generally happy with the current ferry service, although there was a general consensus that there is a need to address capacity constraints and issues related to the future replacement of vessels.

Some gaps in the existing timetable and problems booking at peak periods were highlighted as key problems, as experienced by many of the consultees. Problems surrounding the congested nature of Symbister Harbour were also emphasised.

With regards to the potential for a fixed link, it was generally agreed that there is a need for further debate on this topic.

In terms of internal transport provision, the biggest issue raised was the condition of Whalsay's roads which were said to be amongst the worst in Shetland.

On Shetland Mainland, it was stated that parking is very restrictive at Vidlin. On occasion when the ferry is diverted, there can be very little room between parked cars and vehicles boarding/disembarking from the ferry. The road from Laxo to Vidlin is very poor and can be dangerous. There are few passing places on this road, and concerns arise when ferries are diverted to Vidlin. On such occasions, conflict can occur between vehicles attempting to catch a ferry departure from Vidlin, and those vehicles recently disembarked at Vidlin.

2.3.5 Bressay

The fixed links arguments on Bressay have been well debated and the Community Council did not wish to use the Transport Strategy consultation to discuss this again. However, it was said that the main concern is that people external to this island make decisions on the future development of Bressay following the implementation of the fixed link, whereas it is believed that the local community should have the greatest say on how the island develops. There is a big concern that the fixed link would lead to an inappropriate increase of housing on the island.

MV Leirna is believed to be a very efficient vessel although, if for any reason Bressay was not to get a fixed link, it was estimated that *MV Leirna* would need replaced in 2020. It was suggested that any new ferry would need to be more powerful, or more wind resilient so that it would not be affected by weather stoppages. Ferry stoppages caused by the weather are viewed as a big problem on the island.

It was suggested that it would be beneficial if the Bressay ferry could be better integrated with other transport services, and specifically the first flight out of Sumburgh. There were also said to be integration problems with the ferry and the bus service. For example, the 08.35 Lerwick town centre bus service leaves just as the Bressay ferry arrives in Lerwick. A more regular Sunday service would also be welcomed.

Bressay is a commuter island and lots of people take their car on the ferry because they work elsewhere in Shetland. However, it was estimated that it costs around £1400 per year for a person on Bressay to commute to Lerwick 5 days a week. Limited parking space and cost of parking at Victoria Pier also prevents Bressay residents from having a mainland car in addition to their island car. Subsequently, fares on the Bressay ferry are believed to be unfair given residents of other isles on Shetland are enabled to own two cars through free parking on Shetland Mainland. It was noted that other island residents had their own facilities on the island, whilst Bressay residents were required to share schools and leisure facilities with Lerwick.

The extra costs that go with living on an island were also highlighted included construction costs which were estimated to cost approximately 10% more on Bressay than Shetland Mainland. Such high costs were explained as a reason for people leaving the island.

In terms of internal transport, areas where footpaths are required were highlighted. In particular, the need for a footpath from the ferry terminal to the Maryfield Hotel was emphasised. Specific parking problems related to tourist coaches visiting the island were also noted.

With reference to public transport, an extension of the Lerwick Shopper's bus to the peripheries of the island was recommended. However, it is expected that a better bus service will be provided to the island once the fixed link has been implement but it was stressed that in the meantime a better bus service is required on the island.

2.3.6 Skerries

The major transport issue in Skerries related to the inter-island ferry service. It was pointed out that the previous vessel used to use both the "South Mouth" and the "Northeast Mouth" on the approach to the pier, and this meant, more often than not, that if the vessel could sail to Skerries, it would be able to safely enter the harbour at Skerries. However, the current vessel (the *MV Filla*) only uses the "Northeast mouth" due to its length. With winds that reach around force 5 or 6, in a North East or Easterly direction, it is considered unsafe to use the Northeast Mouth. A large sea swell in this approach can also prevent safe passage. The community expressed their disappointment that nothing has been done to solve this problem yet, as they understood that the Council would "get the boat sorted out first, and then get the south mouth sorted." The main option for resolving the south mouth issue was believed to be a dredging operation.

The problem with the additional unreliability of the service was felt to be a problem all the year round, and is not restricted to the winter months, although consideration of the number of cancelled bookings would not provide the full picture because if the weather looks unfavourable then people will not book the crossing, and the ferry would not run in any case.

A further problem noted was the distress caused when the ferry set out in "border-line" conditions, only to reach Skerries and then have to turn back to the Mainland due to conditions in the Northeast Mouth.

The community perceived there to be a lack of flexibility and commitment to the island by the ferry crew, who along with the vessel, were based on Whalsay. The observed lack of flexibility and commitment to the local community contrasted with the Loganair pilots, who were able to try and be flexible for the sake of the community.

A longer term priority is for a ferry and crew to be based on Skerries, to assist with the future economic and social prospects of the island.

It is also thought that if the Bressay Bridge is built, then the ferry linkspan at Lerwick could be lost.

The lack of connecting transport at Vidlin was raised as a concern, particularly for those without a car. These folk typically rely on the longer run direct to Lerwick twice a week. It was suggested that a scheme, similar to the "book ahead" taxi service to Tingwall, could be provided from Vidlin.

2.3.7 Papa Stour

Questionnaires were sent to all residents of Papa Stour as well as the absentee crofters who still own property on the island and commute regularly to the island. Individual meetings were also offered to all residents, and two households accepted this invitation. Consultation was also conducted via letters and email correspondence.

A number of different views were offered, the majority of which centred on the newly introduced £3 million ro-ro ferry service to West Burrafirth, and the lack of public transport between West Burrafirth and Lerwick. It was stated that the huge cost of providing transport services to islands should be borne in mind as there is no bottomless pit of money. It is the responsibility of everyone to spend the money wisely and a few small adjustments (i.e. changing sailing times) could make a big difference at little cost.

With specific regards to the ferry service, the view has been expressed that the ferry to Papa Stour is timetabled to benefit the visitors and absentee landlords, and not the people who live on the island. The ro-ro ferry has undoubted benefits for those with cars but members of the community without their own car get no benefit from the introduction of the ro-ro ferry and there is concern over the future dial-a-ride connecting service from West Burrafirth if more and more people use their own cars rather than take this service.

Concerns were also raised about the possibility of mini tour operators booking a minibus with twelve passengers onto the Papa Stour ferry as this would prevent any resident from travelling into Papa Stour at the same time or indeed any essential service provider (home help, BT, Scottish Hydro electric etc). Given that the ferry is limited to carrying a maximum of twelve passengers at any one time, this must be taken into consideration when putting forward any proposals for the future of the Papa Stour ferry service.

Some specific changes were also recommended to the ferry timetable including the provision of a Sunday morning sailing, an additional Monday evening sailing and a later sailing on a Wednesday in order to allow more productive time to be spent on Shetland Mainland. Cheaper fares for vehicles were also suggested as were more frequent sailings.

It was also said that there is a need for more frequent transport links between the Papa Stour ferry and Lerwick. There are a maximum of sixteen ferry sailings per week, but only 5 connect with public transport to or from Lerwick. In order to allow people to live on the island and commute to the Mainland, it was stated that there is a need to complete the missing link by providing access to onward transport to and from Lerwick. Tourism was also believed to present an important future development opportunity for Papa Stour, but at present, the lack of public transport between Lerwick and the Papa Stour ferry terminal at West Burrafirth was believed to be a limitation to this. It was stated that if the Council are prepared to spend £3 million on a new ferry service they need to make it work by providing transport to the ferry in the first place for visitors. A suggested answer to the lack of transport between Lerwick and West Burrafirth could be a dial-a-bus service, which only runs when bookings are made so that it operates to minimal costs.

Support was offered for the inter-island air service to the island as this was seen as an essential service, as it is a quick way to get on and off the island and vital for emergency purposes. The $\pounds 1$ dial-a-ride taxi from Tingwall Airport was also viewed as a very good service.

Foula

2.3.8

The importance of maintaining the ferry on the island was the key issue emphasised during the consultation with Foula residents. It was explained that the Foula Co-op could take ownership of the ferry to secure its future. SIC are currently proposing to put the ferry out to tender and Foula residents hope to take over the running of the service – not for profit, but to secure its function as a lifeline link. The ferry was said to impact every part of Foula's economy as, in addition to the ferry jobs, the ferry helps to sustain families on the island, as the ferry is the means of getting everything on and off the island. The ferry serves an important role for taking cargo into the island and it was suggested that if SIC had to vary the prices, Foula residents would much rather that passenger fares were increased rather than freight fares. The local knowledge of the ferry crew in spotting weather windows was also stated in support of the Foula Co-op scheme.

One problem regarding the ferry relates to the current route used for the service, as the ferry now enter Walls via the east entrance as opposed to the west entrance, which was said to take an extra 20 minutes.

The air service is the most common method used by residents to travel to Shetland Mainland. It was stated that there was great support for retaining Tingwall as the main airport for the interisland flights because it is close to Lerwick and easy access is provided by the Tingwall dial-aride taxi. Regarding air fares, it was felt that the air fares to the island are expensive and the idea of establishing an air fare structure system throughout Shetland, based on the structure established in the Orkney Islands was suggested. It was also advised that Loganair should impose penalties for those who book seats for the plane but do not take them up, or at least those who fail to inform Loganair that they need to cancel their bookings. Moreover, it was suggested that incentives could also be given to those who fly to the island and stay overnight in order to help Foula to capture the benefits of tourism.

In reference to the air timetable, there is a desire to see another day with an extra return flight, thus making it possible to fly to the Mainland and return to Foula on the same day.

Concerns were raised over delivery firms not delivering parcels to the small islands such as Foula. Instead deliveries are taken by hauliers i.e. Streamline and simply deposited at Walls pier, and it was said to be luck more than anything else if the parcels got delivered. Only the Royal Mail provide a door delivery service and there are concerns that if they continue to be undercut by delivery firms that are not carrying out their job properly, Royal Mail could cut back its level of service.

2.3.9 Fair Isle

Similar to Foula, the main issue relating to transport in Fair Isle was that the local residents want the ferry to remain based on the island. It was unanimously agreed that the ferry crew offer an excellent, flexible and, essentially, demand responsive service. For example, whenever fog forces the cancellation of flights, the ferry crew can be quickly assembled and are ready to charter the ferry to Shetland Mainland. This is an advantage of having the ferry based on the island. There is also a desire to see a slightly bigger/faster boat replace the Good Shepherd when it is eventually replaced. However, it was said to be essential that the new boat remains multi-purpose for cargo purposes. Like Foula, if ferry prices were to increase, it is hoped that increases would be relayed onto passenger fares rather than cargo costs.

Regarding the timetable of the ferry, it was suggested that it could be beneficial to provide an additional ferry sailing per week in the summer, and specifically August, when it can sometimes be difficult to book a place on the ferry. It was also suggested that the changing frequency of the ferry from three ferries in the summer timetable, to just one ferry in the winter timetable is too abrupt and thus an extension of the summer timetable into October, or at least initially decreasing the frequency from three weekly sailings to two would be beneficial. The sailing to Lerwick is also valued, especially for the transport of freight and building materials, with additional benefits for residents doing a day's business in Lerwick.

The complementary nature of the ferry and the air service was also noted as one of the key factors crucial to the island's success. With regards to the inter-island air service, a scheduled flight to Orkney from Fair Isle would be welcomed. Although such a service operated in the past, it is believed that this should be trialed again. Some consultees also stated that they would like to see an extension of the Saturday service into the end of October to tie in with the bird season and the October holidays. It was reported that there are often occasions when locals are unable to get on their desired flights and it is believed that an advantage of offering additional flights on the same day is that this would ease the problems of backlog.

There were complaints regarding the booking system at Tingwall, in respect of the booking system, and "no shows." It is frustrating for Fair Isle residents when they are informed that flights are full, and then find that they are half empty. It was believed that the main source of no-shows are workmen and day-trippers, as opposed to locals, or visitors who are staying at the Bird Observatory. Whilst the ability to cancel flights was seen as an advantage of the Loganair flights, it was recommended that workmen and day trippers are forced to either pay in advance or pay booking fees. It would also be beneficial if Loganair could confirm flights (i.e. by email or fax) as many of the visitors to the island are left worried by the fact that they receive no confirmation about their flight details.

It was believed that the only way of making the air service more reliable and lift the problems of fog would be to build a new airstrip on lower ground closer to sea level. The only low ground available on the island is used for agricultural purposes and therefore somebody would have to be prepared to give up some of their land for a new airstrip to be developed.

The Extra Regular Flight (ERF) and Community Bank systems are seen as grey areas to the islanders and some public clarification would be useful, either through a public meeting or through a press release.

The group is very happy with Tingwall as the main destination and feels that this should be safeguarded as the island's main connection point for inter-island flights, although a link to Sumburgh was also believed to be important on Saturdays for tourists.

There are concerns that the current pilots that operate the Loganair service may be lost if Loganair lose the inter-islands air service contract. These pilots are extremely highly valued by the Fair Isle residents and there is a fear that if the pilots leave, this will be 20 years of experience down the drain.

With regards to transport services on Shetland Mainland, support was given for the Tingwall dial-a-ride service, and the operation of a similar service from Grutness Pier to meet the Fair Isle ferry would be welcomed.

2.4 Other Issues

The sections above have concentrated specifically on the transport issues, concerns and opportunities identified by the community groups consulted for the purposes of the RTS. However, discussion also turned to some of the wider issues that are affected by transport in Shetland, such as access to health and education.

2.4.1 Access to Health

Access to health was a prominent issue discussed during the community consultation, especially in the meetings with the residents of Shetland's outer isles.

In particular, the importance of providing a relief nurse to the islands when their resident nurse is away on Shetland Mainland was stressed. This relates primarily to timetable options where daytrips to the Mainland are possible. With regards to accessing health on Shetland Mainland, residents of the outer isles generally believed that this is improving as consideration is now being given to the location of these residents and transport connections when setting appointments.

However, concerns still exist over the NHS 24 service, with residents in Fair Isle concerned that those at the end of their calls are unaware where some of the islands are located. There are also some concerns over how the air ambulance service will work when it is taken over by the oil sector helicopter service.

2.4.2 Access to Education

The difficulties of being separated from children, when they have to leave the small isles to attend Anderson High on Shetland Mainland, was stated as a great problem on the isles which many families have avoided through leaving the isles altogether. Whilst the benefits of attending Mainland schools for social integration purposes was recognised, it was also said to be equally important that pupils from the small isles are given many opportunities to return home.

If possible, the introduction of later flights on Fridays, after school has finished, so that parents can get their child home for the weekend would be welcomed. An earlier flight on Mondays so that pupils returning home for the weekend could do so without missing too much school would also be desirable. It is believed that even if this schedule was only provided during the first term, it would be a great help, especially for those in first year who are more likely to suffer home-sickness during their first term off the island.

2.4.3 Future Viability of the Outer Isles

With regards to economic development of the small isles, it was recognised that to live on some of the smaller isles, it is necessary to work in more innovative or unique industries that are not

so heavily reliant on transport. For example, the benefits of broadband were stated in allowing for homeworking. The potential for decentralisation was also raised and recommended on many of the small isles.

Many islanders consulted realised that their islands are under threat due to ageing and declining populations, and transport improvements were identified as one way to overcome these problems. However, others were more realistic and realised that transport is only one part that contributes to island sustainability.

3 Stakeholder Consultation

Introduction

3.1

In this section, the key findings from the consultation process undertaken with other stakeholder groups are presented. These groups are classified as follows:

- Shetland Islands Council and Partner Organisations (i.e. Shetland Enterprise, HIE)
- Businesses Transport (i.e. public transport operators, hauliers)
- Businesses Seafood
- Businesses Livestock
- Public Sector Services
- Tourism
- Businesses Other (i.e. oil, construction)
- Voluntary Sector
- Youth Groups
- Retail Sector
- Education Services
- The Elderly

Again, it is to be re-emphasised that there has been a great deal of repetition in terms of the issues raised during consultation. Whilst this is positive and provides confidence in the results collected, this section will avoid over-repetition and will simply concentrate on the key issues over and above those already raised in this report.

3.2 Shetland Islands Council and Partner Organisations

In addition to ongoing consultation during the RTS development process through the RTS Officer Working Group (involving Roads service, Public Transport service, Ferry service, and Planning service), additional consultation was undertaken with other services and public sector organisations.

3.2.1 Housing Services

Areas where houses remain unoccupied for a long time tend to be in outer areas furthest away from Lerwick. There are a lot of unoccupied houses in the west mainland for example, which has a single track road and subsequently seems more remote. Therefore, improved transport links could perhaps help overcome the perceptual barriers of living away from Lerwick.

It is believed that the Bressay Bridge could open up land on the island to housing and this could help to relieve some of the pressure for housing and overspill from Lerwick.

It was also pointed out that it is traditional for Shetlanders to build their own houses, but the costs of transport make it more difficult to encourage development in more remote rural areas. Therefore, if the council was to encourage people to move into more remote areas, perhaps discounted transport costs could be investigated.

3.2.2 Education Services

The difficulties of retaining schools in Shetland were stressed in an era of ageing populations and decreasing school rolls. It is believed that transport has a vital role to play in making Shetland's education system more sustainable. For example, fixed links would make it easier for pupils to travel to schools on neighbouring islands or on the Mainland. Even without fixed links, better integration of the ferry and school times could help. It was stated that if transport links were improved, there would be greater opportunity to optimise the education budget.

It was also suggested that the potential for changing school catchments according to transport considerations be investigated because more and more parents from outlying areas (eg Whiteness) are requesting their children go to school in Lerwick because it is easier for the parent to drop their child off on their way to work in Lerwick. It was reminded that in the past, all secondary education provision in Shetland was centralised in Lerwick.

It was stated that there is an apparent lack of resources for special needs educational transport in Shetland. It was also noted that the cost of special events for children and young people becomes very high when the costs of travel to and from the event are taken into account.

3.2.3 Childcare Partnership

The Childcare Partnership has two transport schemes – a pre-school transport scheme and the rural transport initiative.

It was explained that the pre-school transport scheme is for those who cannot access preschool provision (i.e. nursery classes) for reasons such as that the parents cannot get them there as they cannot afford the transport or are too unwell themselves to arrange the transport.

It was mentioned that the current transport services are unsuitable for many – whilst there may be transport in one direction to drop off, rarely is there return transport in the rural areas. Although the cost of providing transport for each child on the scheme is very high, there is believed to be a great deal of satisfaction with the service. It was also suggested that greater co-ordination of nursery and school times could in some instances help to solve some of the problems discussed.

The Rural Transport Initiative is another successful scheme and there are currently 4 childcare providers who benefit from the RTI, including 2 out of school clubs in Lerwick, which involves minibuses picking up children from schools in Lerwick and taking them to the after-school clubs which are located elsewhere in the town. It is believed that the key to the success of the Childcare Partnership is the local grass roots partnership workings. For example the Partnership have good relationships and close communication with other SIC departments such as the public transport division.

There is a desire to see more after-school clubs located in schools, as sometimes the best transport measures are those that enable access by not moving children around and the provision of after school clubs within schools would be a great help to this.

Staff training on the mainland, or attendance at seminars, has a major impact on budgets as in addition to travel costs, there are also accommodation costs to account for.

3.2.4 Community Care

Transporting people to the day care centres can be a problem. The further away people in need of care are from Lerwick, the more disadvantaged they are. For example, public transport is difficult to provide in rural areas. It was stated that there is a need to make better use of the services that are available.

With an ageing population, the dependence placed on the care sector in Shetland is growing. There has been a drift in population to Lerwick over the years, which makes it easier to provide care (i.e. less travel for workers etc), but there are still many people in the peripheral areas of Shetland that require care.

Again, the cost of sending staff to Scotland Mainland for training purposes were said to have a major impact on budgets. The Social Care department utilise video-links for a lot of their meetings, although this is still only a second best option as many businesses do not have this equipment.

3.2.5 Shetland Enterprise

Shetland Enterprise hoped that the influence of SIC is not weakened by the decision to create its own RTP.

Shetland Enterprise are enthusiastic about an Aberdeen-Rosyth ferry link, believing that this would make it easier to transport goods to the continent by integrating the ferry at Rosyth with the link to Zeebrugge. Bellshill was also said to be an important destination for seafood, and it is thought that if road charges for haulage are increased, this could encourage more freight to stay on the ferry to Rosyth. Shetland Enterprise would like to see a study progressed on the points of origin of goods entering Shetland, as such an investigation could suggest a need to change links.

The importance of sustaining the inter-island links was also emphasised, and it is believed that decentralisation could help to increase the sustainability of rural areas. Shetland Enterprise would like to see SIC jobs decentralised. Shetland Enterprise adopt the view that fixed links should be seen as an option for improving transport and the economy, but that a more thorough investigation of the impacts of fixed links is necessary first.

Shetland Enterprise believes that links to Scandinavia are important especially for tourism.

3.2.6 NHS Shetland

It was emphasised that NHS Shetland recognised the important links between transport and health and this is shown through the NHS 2020 report. The specific section on transport issues was presented to the consultants. A survey was also being conducted on transport and health on behalf of NHS Shetland (the results are presented later in this report).

Providing local accessibility to primary health care is very difficult in Shetland given the geographically dispersed population characteristics of the island. The high costs involved in transferring patients from Shetland to Aberdeen for health treatment was also stressed.

3.2.7 Highlands and Islands Enterprise

HIE are keen the new RTP for Shetland actively maintain links within HITRANS organisation, and considered that both Orkney and Shetland had many transport issues in common.

Key priorities for the Shetland Transport Strategy would undoubtedly be accessibility, and encouraging and supporting internal economic strengths. Developing strategies to improve external links, and reduced costs were suggested as being important.

In relation to the NorthLink service, it was suggested that options needed to be considered for the future. It was highlighted that lower air fares, and more frequent flights could help to overcome peak issues, and this could be a lot cheaper to achieve than new ferries, and new port infrastructure.

In relation to the fixed links issue, the need to undertake a detailed economic assessment was emphasised as fixed links will have numerous knock on consequences.

The potential for the Smyril Line service to form one element of a northern Atlantic Short Sea Shipping network was also highlighted.

3.3 Businesses - Transport

3.3.1 Hauliers

Hauliers consulted during the consultation process included Streamline, Northwards, and JBT.

In terms of the local road network, it was suggested that whilst roads to the north and south are fine, the roads to the west mainland were not nearly as good. It was noted that there is a lot of salmon farming in this area which requires efficient transport links. Therefore, it was advised that the main road west is improved.

From a haulier's perspective, the current inter-island links are believed to be greatly improved compared to previous. Some specific gaps in the ferry timetables were raised.

With regards to the NorthLink ferry service, it was generally viewed that the service is much better and more reliable than the previous P&O service. On the other hand, it was noted that it could be difficult to gain permission to load freight onto the passenger vessel. A larger shared freight/passenger vessel was suggested within the consultation.

There was a degree of conflict amongst hauliers regarding whether Aberdeen should remain as Shetland's mainland ferry port, or whether a new port should be used, with Rosyth the most likely alternative. Rosyth was favoured by one haulier because the vast majority of freight travelling to and from Shetland is destined for a location further south than Aberdeen. There was also stated to be problems with Aberdeen Harbour, and whenever the ferry was delayed, this had significant cost implications for the haulier. However, others suggested that Aberdeen should remain as Shetland's mainland port as UK hauliers are increasingly trunking up to Aberdeen due to the availability of back loads. A move to Rosyth could reduce overall logistical efficiency.

There was support for the re-introduction of a freight users forum with NorthLink or the successor operator.

3.3.2 Public Transport Providers

Meetings were held with the John Leask and Son, and also local service providers including RG Jamieson, which are based in Yell. It was stated that the new ferries that operate across the Yell Sound are considered to be good. Fixed links would be welcomed, preferably in the form of tunnels rather than bridges. It was also said that roads throughout Shetland were generally of a good standard.

3.3.3 Ferry Stakeholders

Groups consulted included NorthLink ferries, Lerwick Port Authority and Aberdeen Harbour Board.

NorthLink Ferries established a business plan based on new ships, improved services, lower fares for passengers, and special offers. It proposed a more customer orientated timetable, with more crossings, and faster sailings, and pro-active marketing in order to generate more islander trips, more frequent trip making, and more tourism related travel. It meant high standards of service, cleanliness and facilities. This has largely been delivered, as shown by the substantial growth on the ferry service to Aberdeen. For example, passenger growth has been high on the Aberdeen to Lerwick route - 65,600 passengers in 2002 to 95,100 passengers in 2004. Similarly there were 21,100 passengers travelling by ferry between Aberdeen and Orkney in 2002, rising to 33,700 in 2004.

Comment was also made on the subsidy problems that the NorthLink ferries have encountered and these have largely been the result of limitations with the information provided in preparing the tender submission, and unforeseen competition after bid submission. With regards to future freight options, it was said that the key element for freight is achieving a balance in freight movements, and the requirement for hauliers to minimise empty running. The key market demand is to leave port as late as possible, but arrive at port as early as possible. The primary load out of Shetland is salmon and a variety of goods enter Shetland via the NorthLink ferries including supermarket products, salmon feed, and other loose goods. The view was expressed that, in the case of diversions, one option is the development of a reliable "plan B". However, it would be important to let everyone know this, in order to reduce dead mileage.

It was recognised that NorthLink have been a victim of their own success. Peak periods are a problem although it is believed that new bidders for the tender are coming up with ways of overcoming this problem. It was said that cabin shortages are a potentially berth management issue, rather than a cabin issue, although the majority of passengers would like a cabin to themselves rather than share. The belief was also stated that there is a market for the existing vessels if they were to be replaced.

Lerwick Port Authority (LPA) stated their belief that the external ferry service has been improved since NorthLink took over from P&O. However, the view was also expressed that when designing the new NorthLink boats, the operators tried to please everybody. There are a large number of people, and a large number of different types of people to try and please with the service.

LPA questioned what advantage there would be to having a service to Rosyth in the future. It is believed that not much has changed since the previous service to Leith was withdrawn. It was said that most hauliers have bases in Aberdeen and so would incur costs moving to Rosyth, and for tourists and Shetlanders travelling south taking the car or train south from Aberdeen to Edinburgh takes about the same length of time as sea passage. Aberdeen harbour is situated centrally to the town; the train station and car hire facilities are close by and the airport is a relatively short journey from the harbour. Aberdeen that people travel to go to hospital for example. However, it is considered that having an alternative to Aberdeen could be beneficial in periods of bad weather when the ferry can't dock in Aberdeen. This would be particularly good for freight deliveries as it would mean that perishable goods would still be able to get delivered.

One of the key development areas for LPA in the future is predicted to be work related to decommissioning.

A meeting was also held with Aberdeen Harbour Board. The main point to emerge from the meeting was the need for a more comprehensive study into the future of the Northern Isles ferry service. It was re-emphasised that there are a lot of issues that should be considered regarding Aberdeen Harbour and potential other ports.

One of the common misperceptions is that the NorthLink ferries are the size that they are because this is the maximum size that Aberdeen Harbour can accommodate (i.e. they were built to suit Aberdeen Harbour). This was not the case. Aberdeen Harbour Board reminded that there was a lack of dialogue from the Scottish Executive initially when the requirement for the new vessels was identified and nobody asked Aberdeen Harbour Board would have been happy to engage in these discussions, although it would have been preferential if this had been discussed before the £3.5 million NorthLink terminal had been built. It was also stressed that only on three occasions in 2005 were the NorthLink ferries unable to dock in Aberdeen due to weather problems. The Harbour Board have and are continuing to look at solutions to improve the harbour entrance, including dredging.

Nevertheless, it was stressed that Aberdeen Harbour Board were up for discussion on future larger ferries and would be prepared to spend money to accommodate this. Passenger numbers from NorthLink have significantly increased in recent years thus Aberdeen Harbour Board are very happy with the link and willing to invest to maintain this connection.

3.3.4 Air Service Stakeholders

Loganair, the operator of Shetland's air services were consulted along with Highlands and Islands Airport Ltd (HIAL).

HIAL stated that the runway at Sumburgh currently caters for the Saab 340 with a full load in fair weather. However, in poor weather (rain or heavy cross winds) some passengers are asked to not travel, receive compensation and alternative travel arrangements are made. The runway extension will take away this problem. Air services operated from Sumburgh in general are not capacity constrained; the exception is the Kirkwall to Inverness leg which is often fully booked.

For 10 years there was a dedicated bus from Sumburgh Airport. This is not provided anymore, although local bus services do call into the airport. However, these buses operate to their own timetable and do not wait for the plane.

Loganair, the operators of the external and inter-island air services in Shetland were also consulted. It was reported that prior to their franchise starting there had been an historic decline in passenger numbers on the external air service due to a combination of high fares, the impact of the NorthLink subsidised service, and the largely unreported impact of "friends and family" oil worker flights out of Scatsta. Since beginning operation of the route, passenger levels have increased due to lower fares, improved frequency and timetable, and more reliable planes.

Loganair recognised that the nature of the operation from Shetland meant that the operating costs would always be relatively high. This is because passenger flows are relatively low, and fixed costs of operation are relatively high. It is difficult to maximise the utilisation of the aircraft with a high number of relatively short regional flights. Overall, this led to a significant mismatch between people's expectations of fare levels, and the actual realistic costs.

In terms of the future, the runway extension work at Sumburgh was welcomed as a measure that will improve the efficiency of the operation at Sumburgh, allowing full payloads in all conditions. With regards to future route development, it was said that opportunities would be focussed on Inverness.

Furthermore, it was recognised that the biggest opportunity for passenger growth would come from intervention which subsidised fare levels. Loganair welcomed the opportunities that would arise from external support for the Highlands and Islands network, particularly opportunities for growing the market, working with lower fares, and increasing passenger flows. Loganair, however, believe that the PSO concept could be unsuitable in the Highlands and Islands due to its relatively short period of operation (3 years), which would lead to difficulties in providing an operationally secure and robust service, the potential for legal challenge, difficulties with "interlining" between different operators, and constraint of innovation on the routes, amongst other reasons.

It was recognised that continued growth on the routes could lead to a review of aircraft type. It was noted that the industry could move very quickly to update fleets when required, and be responsive to demand.

With reference to the inter-islands air service, Loganair believe that the level of service and nature of service that they provide to the outer isles is widely appreciated. However, there is a significant level of uncertainty regarding the current status of the re-tendering process.

In reference to the potential future development of the inter-island air service, Loganair noted that there could be significant opportunities for improving the level of service, as utilisation is relatively low. This could include extra flights to Fair Isle during the peak summer/autumn periods, and more day return trips to some of the outer islands.

Following on from the community consultation held to date, the potential for the re-introduction of a Saturday flight to Orkney to/from Fair Isle was raised. It was noted that such a service could be both viable and attractive, and was previously run. However, there were operational difficulties with such a service, particularly in managing sufficient pilot cover, leading to a service that was not operationally robust. Significant problems could arise if the single scheduled flight was disrupted due to weather problems.

The views of one of the pilots of the Loganair inter-island air service were also gathered. The respect and value placed on the service due to its functions as a life-line link by residents was recognised by the pilot. Key factors stated for the success of the inter-island air services were the flexibility of the service and the local grass roots knowledge and contact with the communities. It was also acknowledged that there could be more flights to the islands in the summer, although it must be remembered that the islands can only cope with a certain amount of visitors due to a lack of visitor accommodation.

Finally, the pilot stressed his concerns that an increased regulatory environment could negatively affect the islander air service.

3.4 Businesses – Seafood

A common point raised by businesses in the seafood sector was that time is crucial when transporting seafood. Given this, the importance of fast, efficient and reliable external transport links was stated to be the main priority of the businesses consulted.

It was stated that the capacity on NorthLink is an improvement over P&O. The ferry departure times were also said to be good. However, it was recommended that there should be a priority system in place that would allow perishable goods (e.g. seafood) to take priority over non perishable goods if ever there are capacity constraints.

A designated diversionary port on the UK for the NorthLink service was also suggested to help overcome the problem of having produce sitting losing value out at sea when the weather makes berthing at Aberdeen impractical. Some suggested that links to Rosyth would help with the issue of a diversionary port and for linking in to the Superfast ferries. Feed companies are located in Bathgate and Grangemouth so Rosyth would work well for these too.

However, other firms suggested that there would be no benefit in having a ferry travelling to Rosyth rather than Aberdeen because the haulage companies all have bases in Aberdeen and it is thought that it would be logistically difficult for them to move to Rosyth. In addition many suppliers are based in Aberdeen.

Another firm suggested that in addition to the establishment of an alternative port of call in times when ferries are prevented from getting into Aberdeen, they would like to have the transport services available (i.e. air services) that would enable them to take control of delivery themselves.

3.5 Businesses – Livestock

Meetings were held with GB and AM Anderson, as well as representatives from the National Farmer's Union and Crofting Foundation. It was stated that the main farming activity on Shetland is sheep and that overall, trends for farming in Shetland suggest a potential downturn in activity. It was estimated that only around 10% of farmers in Shetland are full time – the rest are part-time crofters. Typically 90,000 lambs would be exported each year, although there has been an increase in recent years due to the scrapie scheme, to around 140,000.

The price of transporting livestock was highlighted as the key issue. The overall value of lambs is declining, whilst the costs of supply and transport are tending to increase. Some example costs were given. For example, lambs were said to be getting $\pounds 20-\pounds 25$ per head early in the season and It currently costs $\pounds 4.83$ per head to transport higher value and larger Island Cross Breed lambs, and $\pounds 2.85$ to transport smaller, lower value Shetland breed lambs to the Mainland. It costs $\pounds 21$ for a bale of hay at the quay in Lerwick, compared to $\pounds 5$ in Aberdeen.

Rising fuel prices are also concerning and it was felt that more pressure needs to be exerted on Ministers at the European level in order to secure fuel rebates for peripheral areas in Scotland.

It was noted that new, compliant lairage facilities were being constructed at Holmsgarth ferry terminal. Shed 5 at Aberdeen Harbour is used for livestock, and has capacity for around 3,000 heads of livestock, although a typical livestock boat can bring in 5,000 heads of livestock. Accordingly, the unloading and onward transfer has to be particularly well managed. It was

believed that the whole process is typically managed very well, with livestock transport waiting in advance. It was however highlighted that improvements to Shed 5 may be required, due to the necessity to renew the infrastructure of the building, and also to comply with welfare standards.

With regards to the transport of livestock, it was said that livestock vessels are leased during an 8 week peak period in September and October, providing 3 decks of pens. This system was said to work well, is fully compliant and is generally the favoured method of transporting livestock from Shetland. However, the current system is also based on the use of "General Livestock Trailers", which are not compliant, and are reaching the end of their operational life. These are basically crates that can be towed onto the vessel. They do not provide water.

The replacement system for the GLTs is dependent on the new operator. The NFU have developed a preferred option, a two tier container, 12m long, using the bottom deck for cattle and the top deck for sheep. For Shetland, both decks would be used for sheep. It is understood that prototype containers will be manufactured, and used on a "trial basis" prior to the manufacturing of replacements for the GLTs. However, the adopted system is to be the responsibility of the preferred bidder. It was stated that the success of the new livestock transfer arrangements would be noted through the changes in price, the capacity of the system, and ease of use/flexibility.

It was pointed out that sheep are relatively hardy to transport and do not get too upset with bad weather (unlike ponies and cattle). Delays do not present a great problem as there is always extra feed and plenty of water on board to accommodate the livestock.

It is believed that there are plans to change the way that livestock is charged on the ferry to being a charge per lane metre occupied rather than a charge per head. This means that vehicles that can carry two or even three levels of livestock would help out financially but currently the boats can not take these kinds of trailer. The cost of importing feed is high due to the peripherality of Shetland. However, it was stated that freight costs are going down relative to other expenses and account for approximately 25% of the business costs. However, it was noted that freight rates had risen by over 4% recently, so in effect it was just a 20% reduction to the farmer.

In reference to future options for the NorthLink ferries, there was enthusiasm for two vessels that were more efficient, and the removal of peak period capacity constraint. Links to Rosyth would also be advantageous in some ways as many of the markets are located in the Borders region. However, it was recognised that the fuller implications of a change of Mainland port would require to be considered.

3.6 Public Sector Services

3.6.1 Emergency Service Providers

Some common points emerged from the meetings with Shetland's emergency services. Firstly, there was desire for fixed links amongst each of the representatives in order to provide direct and quicker access to islands and to allow the services to pool resources.

Secondly, Northern Constabulary and the Fire Brigade have their main headquarters based in Inverness and thus better connections that would allow return day travel to Inverness would be advantageous and would reduce the transport and accommodation costs currently incurred with training or meetings.

A point raised both by Northern Constabulary and the Ambulance service was the belief that on the whole the standard of driving in Shetland is poor and drivers need a lot more education. It was thought that there is no information in the Highway Code to give guidance to drivers about what they should do if an ambulance is approaching them.

It was believed that road accident statistics for Shetland are higher than national levels and not much different from those of 20 years ago. Given that the islands' roads have significantly improved over this period, it was stressed that driver behaviour is the main cause for accidents, and thus must be looked at.

According to Northern Constabulary, speed limits are okay throughout Shetland, although the police would have no objections to setting lower limits outside schools.

It was stated that drink-driving is a big problem, especially on the islands. Night buses are seen as crucial in helping the police to tackle this problem.

Finally, it was stated that the problems and solutions for Shetland could be very difficult to sum up into a 'strategy' as the way things work and the problems and solutions in the Shetland context may not always fit into a conventional strategy. For example, the weather has the biggest impact on transport. Solutions to overcome problems in the Shetland context come down to local people and often local connections, such as the police force's arrangements with the local Land Rover Club who will help them get to places that may be inaccessible by police vehicles in certain conditions. These are the type of solutions that do not fit into a flow chart or strategy, yet these are the strategies that work for Shetland.

3.6.2 Health Centres

Health Centres try to accommodate people who have to use public transport by offering them appointments at the times they can access the Health Centre. They cannot however reserve appointments for people who need to use public transport. It was said that some patients have to sit and wait for hours in surgery waiting rooms for the next service bus to enable them to go home. A dial a ride scheme would be a good service to overcome this problem.

3.6.3 Royal Mail

Sumburgh was said to be fine as Shetland's main airport, although it would be useful if the airport had longer operating hours, especially in the morning.

The inter-islands ferry services work well as far as mail transport is concerned. The mail service just fits in whenever the ferries run. However, it would be beneficial if the ferry voice banks were updated more regularly. This can cause delays to postmen who are often left waiting for hours at ferry terminals. The inter-islands air service works well again, with no real logistical problems. It was stated that the islanders appreciate the level of service they get given where they live.

Shetland's main roads are believed to be excellent although there are sometimes problems with single track roads in the more rural areas.

3.7 Tourism Sector

Consultation was undertaken with VisitScotland's Shetland area manager and tourist attraction providers. With regards to internal transport provision, it was revealed that, in general, tourists think that transport is good and that the road infrastructure provided on Shetland is excellent. There is a visitor's pass which is a catch all ticket however this is not promoted. Tourists were also said to make good use of bus services.

It was recommended that Shetland look to the Faroe Islands and Norway and how they deal with transport provision (in particular their use of tunnels) in a climate and topography similar to Shetland. Bridges can be affected by weather and spoil landscapes – with tunnels, islands can still appear to be "islands" but with more convenient, more weather proof links.

Transport between Sumburgh and Lerwick was seen as a problem with taxis being so expensive that a one way car hire may sometimes be more cost effective.

With regards to inter-island transport, it was said that Loganair provide a good service and air transport is important from a tourist perspective for Fair Isle, Foula and Skerries. Tingwall is convenient but not considered to be cost effective. It was thought that there would be more opportunity to promote the outer islands if the air services could be operated out of Sumburgh.

Despite good transport services to the islands, it was pointed out that there are capacity problems regarding the outer islands in terms of lack of accommodation and lack of transport provision.

In terms of external transport links, it was stated that the schedule is adequate although there are problems when arriving in Orkney so late at night. The service provided by NorthLink is believed to be good with regards to customer care. The marketing of the service has also worked well – in some cases too well as there is now an over-demand. However, it is believed that the NorthLink service is provided on the wrong type of ferry and there should be better use of space to increase capacity. The benefits of ferry links to Rosyth were acknowledged with regards to the offer of connections to the Continent using the Superfast ferries.

Smyril Line is regarded as an important link, although it was said that the current timetable does not work well.

It is believed that tourist growth can only be achieved through greater air provision. Atlantic Airways' flights to the Faroes and Stansted were welcomed. With regards to the current air service, PSOs were recommended in order to increase competition and hopefully reduce air fares. Accessibility and marketing of the air services should be improved.

3.8 Other Businesses

Other businesses consulted during the RTS consultation included firms from the construction, manufacturing, oil, and renewable energy industries.

With regards to the views on transport gathered from consultees involved in the construction industry, it was said that the provision of a ferry service to Rosyth would be beneficial although it was considered that Aberdeen is still the best link and any service to Rosyth would be in addition to this.

Ferry transport to and from the other islands of Shetland was said to be very good. There can sometimes be a problem with capacity, but these issues can be worked around. In addition, the air links to the outer isles are very good.

The roads provision at present is thought to be of fairly good quality. The roads on the west and north sides of Mainland Shetland could be improved.

Support was also given for fixed links as it was said that time is wasted waiting for ferries and this costs money to businesses.

During consultation with representative from the Sullom Voe oil terminal, it was said that the biggest negative transport impact that could affect the terminal would be if Scatsta Airport was not available. There were said to be many benefits of Scatsta over Sumburgh. For example, it takes an additional hour to get from Sumburgh to the Sullom Voe Terminal which is a significant loss of time, which in the case of senior management is an expensive waste of time. Flights into Scatsta allow employees visiting the Terminal to get a full days' work.

The future prospects for the oil industry in Shetland were also discussed and it was suggested that although North Sea oil is declining there is more and more work in the Atlantic and, consequently, the industry is expected to keep operating at least until 2020. However, given past predictions about oil resources, it was pointed out that there may still be work at the terminal beyond 2020. Nevertheless, it was emphasised that the Council must start to make contingency plans for the future, as when the SVT contract ends, the agreement is for the terminal to be knocked down and grass reinstated. Therefore, there is a need for plans to overcome the loss of the oil terminal in terms of future employment and the economy.

PURE in Unst were also consulted and it was stated that hydrogen is going to be an important component of the energy mix in the future. It is believed that there is significant opportunity for hydrogen infrastructure across the Highlands and Islands, and Shetland and it is envisaged and hoped that SIC will play an important role in the future in supporting the technology developed by PURE. With specific regards to existing transport services, it was pointed out that the Unst ferry constrains access in summer.

3.9 Voluntary Groups

Voluntary groups including Disability Shetland have also been consulted as part of the RTS problems and opportunities identification process.

A key point to emerge from consultation was that transport provision appeared disjointed in Shetland and there is need for greater communication so that resources can be pooled. For example, Disability Shetland has their own minibus that could be used by other services. It is believe that there is lots of great transport provision on Shetland – but it could become even better if this was better tied together. The idea of getting together a pool of services and sharing resources was discussed as one way of improving transport efficiency on Shetland.

It was commended that disability training is being undertaken to ensure that ferry crews can efficiently assist disabled ferry users. It was recommended that this training is rolled out to other transport sectors (i.e. bus drivers and airport staff).

The need to organise health appointments around transport connections was also highlighted.

Another example that emphasises the need to organise events with consideration of local circumstances is drugs treatment. The Scottish Executive provides guidance on the giving out of methadone and state that it can only be given out between 9am and 10am. However, this does not work in the Shetland context due to the local transport system.

With regards to external transport and health, most people who are ill travel by plane and it was emphasised that there is a need to plan ahead for these patients.

3.10 Youth Groups

The main source of comments from young people in Shetland on transport were gathered through consultation with Shetland's Youth Voice Panel, and attendance at the Brae Youth Conference where workshops were held involving around 50 pupils drawn from school across Shetland.

With regards to external services, the view was expressed that it does not make sense that young people under the age of 16 are not allowed to travel on the ferry on their own, but they are allowed to travel on the plane unaccompanied. It was highlighted that for the majority of families, the ferry was the only affordable means of getting off the island. Several first hand experiences were provided of the sheer discomfort experienced when travelling on the ferry when no cabins were available to be booked.

It was thought that young people under the age of 16 should be exempt from having to pay air fares on flights from Shetland, or should at least have reduced fares. Young people also thought that the Smyril Line should stop in Lerwick for longer than it currently does in order to allow more people to spend more time and money in Shetland.

In terms of internal transport, it was said that pedestrian areas in Lerwick still allow cars to drive through them, for example to get to the bank.

The main concern with public transport was that the timetables rarely catered for young people's needs – i.e. evening / late night / weekend services. It was suggested that there should be a 20p bus fare around Lerwick. The need for more buses on Whalsay and Unst was also highlighted. It was also stated that there should be late night bus services to the north mainland, more buses during the day for Northmavine and Friday and Saturday night bus services to south mainland. It is also thought that there are too many people standing on the bus to the point that it is dangerous.

Young people would also like to be allowed to make use of the Young Scot discount card on taxis. It was suggested that an on-demand service be implemented for young people that operated at off peak times and linked into activities and also to special events. It is also thought that school buses could be better used to provide a service to after school activities and to other places and events. There should also be more information targeted at young people as to how they can save money on public transport.

3.11 Retail Sector

Consultation was undertaken with a representative of Shetland's Retailers Association, who had taken some views from a number of retailers in relation to the transport consultation prior to the meeting. Through these discussions, it was realised that there should be some central point of information about how to manage transport to and from the islands.

The overriding complaint from retailers was that external links are too expensive, particularly freight links via NorthLink and Streamline.

There is concern over the Royal Mail's proposal to charge for bulk as well as weight, and it is considered that this will have an impact on the retailers. Inter-island and internal links are not of great concern most retailers have vans and their own means of transport.

The idea of NorthLink going directly to Rosyth could impact on the retailers as it would open up different shopping markets on the UK which could take business from the local retailers.

3.12 Education

Primary schools on many of the outer isles, as well as Anderson High and Brae High Schools, and Shetland College were consulted to gather views on transport from an education provider perspective.

At each of the schools consulted, specific problems related to walking and cycling opportunities, traffic speeds, and parental parking were raised. On the whole, school transport services were highly commended. However, it was said that if pupils were allowed to use their free bus passes on service buses this would allow more pupils to benefit from after school clubs.

With reference to the inter-islands service, it was said that it was unfortunate that pupils from the small isles, particularly Fair Isle, who attend Anderson High have to miss part of class on Friday afternoons and Monday mornings because of the inter-island air service timetable. In the long-term, the time pupils spend out of class is considerable. Whilst later or earlier flights would be desirable, it was recognised that there is not much that can be done to overcome this.

Schools on the outer isles take pupils on trips to Shetland Mainland (i.e. for swimming and PE purposes) as well as trips to the other outer isles. These trips are said to be key for the social integration of the youngsters. Schools also use the NorthLink and Smyril Line service for class trips. The NorthLink service is believed to be a good service, and there are normally no capacity problems because bookings are made well in advance. In reference to the Smyril Line service, it was stated that there were initial problems with the service but gradually it is improving.

Schools also use the external air links for staff development and meetings, as well as for the odd sports event. It was stated that the flight timetable has improved and the ability to fly to Edinburgh and back on the same day is much welcomed. However, the cost of flights and extra accommodation costs has a major impact on budgets.

Shetland College would like to see better transport links provided to Edinburgh.

3.13 The Elderly

Consultation was undertaken with patients attending the Lerwick flu fair held at the Clickimin Centre in October 2005. A range of comments were received with those interviewed including the cost of external transport connections. Access to health centres, hospitals in Lerwick, and hospitals on the Mainland were also highlighted as issues for elderly members of Shetland's community.

4 Further Consultation

4.1 Introduction

In addition to the consultation events, information has been gathered from a number of other sources using methods such as questionnaires. Wherever possible, existing relevant information has been used to inform the RTS consultation process. 'Further consultation' techniques or sources used for the purposes of the RTS consultation have included:

- Comparison of 'Your Voice' Questionnaire 2005 and 2000 NOP Travel Needs Surveys;
- Review of 'Transport to Local Health Facilities Survey', NHS Shetland 2005;
- Review of previous consultation undertaken as part of the Initiative at the Edge project;
- Letters to Parliamentary Representatives;
- Library Van Questionnaires;
- Questionnaires for the Transport Strategy website; and
- Review of transport threads on the 'Have Your Say' online discussion forum.

The following sections summate the key findings from each of these sources.

4.2 Your Voice Questionnaires

4.2.1 General Introduction

This report looks at the recently completed 'Your Voice' Autumn 2005 questionnaire, and compares the questions in this related to transport with a survey completed in October 2000 by NOP. In addition some transport related results are included from the 'Your Voice' March 2005 questionnaire.

The 'Your Voice' Autumn 2005 questionnaire was the third 'Your Voice' questionnaire to have been completed by the recently created 'Your Voice Opinion Panel'. The panel contains 585 members who are representative of the population of Shetland. Approximately 49% of the panel responded to this questionnaire, equating to approximately 287 people. The survey is sent out by post, and includes a freepost envelope for responses.

The Autumn 2005 questionnaire was comparable to a survey completed by NOP in October 2000. This survey was completed by telephone with a total of 520 adult (aged 16 or over) respondents. The data used in the compilation of the report is weighted by age, sex, postcode sector and car ownership according to 1998 population statistics in order to make them as representative as possible of the residents of the islands.

4.2.2 Questionnaire Findings

This section of the report highlights some of the key findings from the questionnaires.

4.2.2.1 External Transport

These questionnaires highlighted that the majority (at least two thirds) of Shetland residents had travelled from the islands in the year prior to the survey. The majority of residents pay full fare for their journey and pay for the journey themselves. The most popular destination was Aberdeen. The main reasons behind choosing a particular mode of transport were cost, speed and comfort. It was found in the 2005 surveys that nearly two thirds of passengers paid full fare for their ticket, and three quarters paid for their ticket themselves. The surveys found that people thought that a fair price for a return ticket to Scotland Mainland would be less than £150. People would be prepared to pay more for a return direct ticket to London. By ferry, the majority of people would prefer to travel to Aberdeen than to Rosyth or another port.

4.2.2.2 Internal Transport

Nearly two thirds of people travel to work by car. Around half of school aged children travel to school by school bus. The issue, according to the 2005 survey, that people wanted SIC to address first with regard to transport was parking, followed by accident reduction and then public transport.

According to the surveys, the majority of households have access to two or more cars or vans, and have two or more people with a driving licence. In excess of 80% of the population use a car to reach health appointments. When asked to rate the bus services, the lowest scoring categories were the frequency of services at the weekend, evening and daytime services. Safety and reliability scored the highest. Generally people were happy with the services offered by the ferry and the inter-island air services. Overall, people also found the roads and the road maintenance service carried out by SIC either satisfactory or good, particularly in terms of street lighting.

Nearly half of the people responding to the questionnaires felt that it was easy to get where they wanted to in Shetland.

4.2.2.3 Previous Survey

A previous Your Voice survey was completed in March 2005. A number of these questions either related to transport issues, or had answers that involved transportation. When asked what people disliked about Shetland 13% said transport costs. In another question, only 1% said that the transport links were something that they liked about the islands. If people could change anything in Shetland, a common theme was a reduction in both the costs of getting to and from the islands and transport on the islands, including reducing the cost of fuel and road tax.

4.2.2.4 Conclusion

The full findings of the surveys are detailed in Appendix C. These include comparison of the 2000 and 2005 surveys where applicable to show the changes in opinion over the years. In general, the results of these surveys have highlighted some of the points relating to problems with transport services in Shetland.

4.3 Health Questionnaire

4.3.1 Introduction

The survey was undertaken in the Day Surgery Unit, Dental Suite and Outpatients Department at Gilbert Bain Hospital, all Health Centres across Shetland and at health facilities on the islands without a resident doctor (Bressay, Fair Isle, Foula, Fetlar and Out Skerries). A summary of the findings of this questionnaire is presented in this section.

4.3.2 Methodology

The survey took place during the month of September 2005 using three questionnaires designed specifically for the purpose. The survey started on Thursday, 1st September 2005 and finished on Friday, 30th September 2005.

During the month of September 2005, staff were asked to distribute the set number of questionnaires (100 to each Hospital Department, 50 to each Health Centre and 20 to each Non Doctor Island) to patients attending the health facility.

Return rates varied between 25% and 100% from each facility.

- 4.3.3 Findings
- 4.3.3.1 Inter Island Transport

At Whalsay Health Centre there was a problem with the bus and ferry timetables not being integrated. There were also problems with the ferry timetable and the cost of transport at Yell Health Centre. On Bressay there was a problem getting appointments to fit in with ferry times. There was also an identified cost in working hours for the time lost waiting for transport connections. On Fetlar there is a problem that people have to travel to Unst in order to get treatment when the clinic is not open on the island.

4.3.3.2 Internal Transport

The main problem was the difficulty in finding a parking place in either the main car park or the disabled car park at the hospital. This is particularly bad on Wednesday and Thursday mornings. There were considered to be inconvenient bus times, or too infrequent buses, resulting in people having to wait at the hospital for hours in order to get home after an appointment. The lack of a dial a ride service was also identified as a problem at the hospital, as was the issue of people with long distances to travel being given early morning appointments.

A lack of public transport was identified as being the major problem at Bixter Health Centre. At Brae Health Centre the public transport timetable is inconvenient. It was found that there is a difficulty in parking at both Hillswick and Lerwick Health Centres. At Levenwick Health Centre there is an insufficient amount of public transport, inconvenient bus times, difficulty in parking, a lack of a dial a ride service and a lack of transport to hospital appointments. There are parking difficulties and inconvenient bus times to Scalloway Health Centre. At the health centre in Walls it is difficult to see traffic on the main road. At Whalsay there is a difficulty in parking. Problems identified at Unst Health Centre included there being no public transport on the island at all, no disabled parking spaces at the health centre, the lower car park has pot holes and the cost of taxis is too high.

On Bressay there is no public transport or taxi service on the island and there is a difficulty accessing transport for elderly and infirm patients. On Fetlar there is a lack of public transport and the local surgery is only held once every two weeks. On Foula, the poor state of the road to the Nurses house is the main problem, and on Out Skerries the doctor's appointments appear to be rushed.

4.3.3.3 Conclusion

The health questionnaire has highlighted the key problems with transport that relate to health issues on Shetland. Many of these have already been highlighted in the above sections. Nevertheless, this report has been useful and important to see the relevant transport problems related to access to health.

4.4 Initiative at the Edge Consultation

4.4.1 Introduction

The Initiative at the Edge (IatE) programme is a community regeneration programme which provides a designated Local Development Officer to work in partnership with the local community to identify their areas needs, required actions and to develop projects accordingly. Four areas in Shetland have been designated IatE status. These are Northmavine and the three inhabited North Isles, Unst, Yell and Fetlar. These areas have been selected as they are considered as having inadequate transport links and having suffered from economic shocks in recent years that have stimulated population or economic declines. A review has been undertaken of the relevant transport issues arising from these initiatives.

4.4.2 Findings

4.4.2.1 Northmavine

The area has been selected for latE status as it is deemed to be suffering from a lack of community facilities and services and there is a perception in the area that it is neglected and forgotten and is relatively peripheral being located in the north west corner of Shetland Mainland. The population is in decline and there are concerns that increasing dependence on facilities out of the area could reduce ties and commitment to Northmavine, which in turn will accelerate depopulation in the area.

Therefore, it will be important that regeneration initiative and projects are set in motion which aims to reverse the economic and social infrastructure decline apparent in the area.

4.4.2.2 Unst

Consultation was undertaken with Unst residents on the 10th of September 2005 in Baltasound Hall. A range of issues were discussed, and comments received at the event are summarised below:

External Transport

 Some consultees would like to see better use made of the airport, suggesting that it could be used for tourism and could offer jobs. There is also a desire for cheaper air fares.

Inter-Island Transport

- Some respondents suggested that they would like to see the same level of ferry service on the Bluemull Sound as that currently in operation over the Yell Sound, which is run by the new *MV Daggri* and *MV Dagalien* vessels.
- There is an aspiration for a fixed link from Unst to Yell, and from Yell to the Mainland.

- Some residents would like to see a more frequent weekend ferry service. In addition, a later night sailing, particularly on Tuesdays, are called for so to allow for attendance of Unst residents at meetings on the Mainland.
- Ferry timetables need to be easier to understand, and also better integrated with other timetables, such as to link with the sailings to Aberdeen.
- The community would like to see better use made of Baltasound pier, such as through encouraging cruise ships and yachts. It was also suggested to encourage tourism by promoting cruise trails around the North Isles. At the same time, however, the need was recognised to offer island facilities in order to capture the benefits of tourism.
- There are safety concerns surrounding the pier at Uyeasound, and hence redevelopment and improvement of the pier was viewed as "essential".

General Comments

- Transport was noted as a "huge" issue on the islands and one that divides the islands.
- It is argued that there is a need to provide better transport services for young people, such as direct services to take young people to disco's and leisure facilities. The mobile cinema was viewed positively, although many would like to see it visit more often.
- The community have identified the need to attract more young people to the island and suggest there is a need to diversify the local economy, attract new employment to the island, and offer a mixture of apprentice jobs in trades, professional jobs and student jobs in order to retain and attract young people to Unst. Efficient transport links are key to attracting employment in the first instance.
- Many industries in the area also face greater problems than Mainland based industry because of the increased time and cost of transportation of freight. Fuel costs are particularly high at the moment, and support for renewable energy initiatives, such as the hydrogen project based on Unst, is growing.
- There is a strong desire to encourage youths to stay on the island but there are limited employment opportunities for youths on Yell. Those who leave the island for higher education purposes often do not return because there are no relevant jobs to come back for.
- Residents have stressed that there is potential to develop economic activity on this
 island through tourism. At present, however, those visitors who do spend time on the
 island do not stay long enough to seriously boost the local economy. In particular, it is
 believed that there is potential for yacht tourism in the area, although this would need to
 be supported by improved infrastructure and marketing.
- Further accommodation, eateries and activities for tourists would also be required to capture the benefits of tourism in Yell. Traditional industries such as crofting could tap into the desires of tourists to see "how things used to be done".
- There is a desire for greater decentralisation of jobs away from Lerwick.
- It was established that there is general support for the development of renewable energy initiatives on the islands.

4.4.2.3 Yell

latE consultation events were held at three locations on Yell (Burravoe, Cullivoe and Mid Yell) during August 2005, with some of the key transport related issues raised at these events highlighted below:

External Transport

- It is believed that the cost of travel to Shetland puts off tourists, and has a negative effect on the north isles because it is felt that the further you go in Shetland, the more you pay.
- Many residents would like to see cheaper air fares to the Shetlands.

Inter Island Transport

- Many residents called for the abolition of ferry fares. The inclusion of ferry fares within road tax costs was also recommended. It was stated that if ferry fares were increased, people would leave the island. A cheaper ferry commuter's season ticket was also recommended to help keep people on the island.
- There are calls to reduce the costs of hiring ferries. Crew already man the ferries and so it is suggested that the price is taken down to be acceptable to an individual who wishes to hire it. A reduction from £350 to £100 was suggested.
- Questions were asked over the need for five ferry crew on late night sailings.
- It is stated that ferry services should be viewed as an extension to the road network in terms of frequency.
- A more frequent ferry service at the weekend would be welcomed. A ferry at 17:50 on weekdays was also recommended as people leaving Lerwick at 5pm have to wait for a long time before sailing.
- There are strong aspirations for fixed links (both across the Bluemull and Yell Sound), as there are large question marks over the sustainability of ferries in the long-term. It was also stated by one respondent that fixed links are a must because at present, 1.5 hours of the working day are lost due to time spent travelling by ferry.
- However, some residents believe that a fixed link could lead to many islanders in the North Isles losing their jobs, and some others dislike this idea as Yell would no longer be an island. There are also concerns about cycling through tunnels, and the fact that a fixed link could deter tourists.
- It was suggested that building a fixed link would not have such an impact on job losses as expected given that a lot of mainland crew are now employed on Yell Sound and that many are now nearing retirement age.
- Some consultees suggested that better information and signage is required on the ferries, particularly for the disabled.
- It was stated that ferry timetables can be difficult to read and there is a need for better advertising of bus and ferry timetables in easily accessible locations.
- A waiting room and not just a bus shelter is advised at the Ulsta ferry terminal.
- There is also an aspiration for a bigger pier, breakwater and landing area with crane at Mid Yell. It is believed that it is overcrowded and dangerous at present.
- There is a desire to provide a slipway at Uyeasound to provide a boat maintenance facility.
- There is some daily ferry commuting by Yell residents for employment at Sullom Voe and Brae. The decline of the oil industry at Sullom Voe will thus have a detrimental impact on Yell as new employment opportunities will be sought.

Internal Transport

• It is believed that the dial-a-ride service on the island is working well, although it was stated that the dial-a-ride timetable is impossible to read.

- Many residents on Yell believe that the public bus service in Yell has improved in recent years.
- The bus service to Lerwick is popular throughout the North Isles, although this service does not help to get people between places in the North Isles.
- There are road safety concerns related with drivers rushing to catch ferries, speeding and dangerously overtaking.
- Roads are generally deemed to be good, especially the main roads, although it is felt that the Cullivoe road needs widening to cope with the level of HGV traffic using the road.
- There are concerns that people who have health appointments in Lerwick, which don't fit with bus services, have to take a taxi, which is expensive.

4.4.2.4 Fetlar

Inter Island Transport

- It is believed that it is very important that a ferry is based on Fetlar. Consultees also
 revealed their desire for a more frequent ferry service to Fetlar. In particular, it was felt
 that there is a need for a late night sailing, so to enable commuters to attend evening
 events on the mainland without having to stay overnight. The need for increased
 sailings at the weekends was also viewed as important in allowing Fetlar residents
 access to the leisure facilities on Yell and Unst.
- There is a need for an early ferry from Fetlar for employment opportunities. There were
 also calls for more direct ferries between Fetlar and Yell, and a second ferry across the
 Bluemull Sound at weekends. A ferry at 1am was also recommended as this would
 enable people to attend events in Lerwick and not have to miss the last couple of hours
 of the event
- It is suggested that ferries should not tie up for lunchtime, as this would free up extra time for more runs.
- There are concerns regarding delays for school children getting back to Fetlar due to ferry timetabling.
- Electronic noticeboards need to have the time of the next ferry and the information also needs to be accurate. There should be noticeboards in waiting rooms for island information.
- There is a need for better communication between ferries. The case was cited where if the ferry on one Sound is delayed, need to ask other to wait for Fetlar traffic or fit in extra run, otherwise Fetlar traffic has to wait several hours for next ferry).
- There is an air strip located on Turra Field, which is used for charter flights or for medical emergencies. It was stated that the emergency plane service must be safeguarded and the airstrip maintained.
- The Fetlar population are generally supportive of the aspirations for an Unst-Yell fixed link, although it is believed that this should not be at the expense of a reduced ferry service to Fetlar. There are also some questions surrounding what impact a Unst-Yell fixed link would have for Fetlar?
- Health related services are believed to be hampered by the ferries. Pregnant women in particular encounter problems in accessing health services including antenatal classes.
- The community have identified the need for a breakwater at Harmars Ness to enable vitally needed pier infrastructure to be developed. The lack of pier and marina is prohibitive to the development of the aquaculture and fishing industries, as well as any potential tourist boat trips.

Internal Transport

- There is a desire to see internal transport developed in Fetlar. There is support for taxis, minibuses and dial-a-ride services, although it is believed that it would not be viable for islanders to individually operate such services, thus funding would be required.
- Fetlar requires flexible public transport that is better integrated with the ferry timetable. The need for more understandable timetables was also noted by Fetlar residents.
- Due to the lack of public transport on the island, people who do not have a car (often young people) have to ask whoever else is on the ferry with them for a lift, which is demeaning.
- Fetlar's roads are generally thought to be good, although there are some areas where resurfacing is required.

General Comments

- It was pointed out that children from Fetlar attend Anderson High School, and if they move onto higher education and acquire qualifications, the need for relevant employment means that it is unlikely that they will return to Fetlar for future employment.
- Declining populations of economically active people makes it difficult to attract new employers to the island. Industries in the area also face greater problems than mainland based industry because of the increased time and cost of transportation.
- There is a desire to attract further tourism to the islands. For this to happen, it is suggested that transport information needs to be improved for visitors.

4.4.3 Conclusion

The latE consultation meetings have emphasised the points made during the community consultation meetings for these areas in relation to transport. This exercise has been worthwhile as it emphasises the transport problems relating to the areas that have been identified as being in need of most help.

4.5 Letters to Elected Representatives

4.5.1 Introduction + Consultation

A letter was sent to the parliamentary elected representatives of Shetland inviting them to participate in the RTS consultation exercise by whatever means they thought best. A copy of this letter was sent to the MP for Orkney and Shetland at Westminster, the constituency MSP for Shetland at Holyrood, the list MSP's for the Highlands and Islands region, and the list MEP's for Scotland. Councillors were invited to take part in the Community Council discussions highlighted earlier in this report. A copy of the letter sent to the parliamentary elected representatives is included in Appendix D.

There was only one letter in response to the letters sent out to the elected representatives. This response requested that the member be kept informed of events that form part of the consultation process.

4.6 Library Van Questionnaire

4.6.1 Introduction

Questionnaires were also issued by the drivers of SIC's mobile Library Vans. A copy of the questionnaire is contained within Appendix E. In total 38 questionnaires were returned.

4.6.2 Findings

4.6.2.1 External Transport

The vast majority of respondents (22) to the library van questionnaire stated that they use both the ferry and the air services to travel to Scotland Mainland. In contrast, only 7 people specified that they travelled by ferry and 2 people specified that they use the air service.

The main reasons for travelling to Scotland Mainland were holidays (24), followed by hospital visits (20) and meeting with family and friends (16). Shopping (6) and work-related trips (3) were also noted as reasons for travelling to Scotland Mainland.

The main problems given on trips by air or sea related to weather related problems, delays or cancellations. The cost of going by air was also given as a problem by many of the respondents to this question. Other comments included that there is not enough accommodation on the ferries, and that flight times do not always suit residents of the isles (i.e. Whalsay) as they require an overnight stay in Shetland Mainland in order to catch early morning flights.

In order to improve the services, reducing the cost of air fares was by and large the most common response. The response of one particular respondent on this issue is given below.

"Fares should be reduced for residents of Shetland. There should be a £80 - £100 return maximium fare for flights anywhere in Scotland. Orkney fares shoud be £100 return. We should have a Shetland ID card to prove residency. Council workers should not book all the cheap seats. We have to live to pay our Council tax which in turn pays your wages and puts food on your table."

Using Scatsta as an alternative flight destination was also raised as a possible way to improve the air service, whilst increasing the accommodation capacity of the ferries was suggested as a way to improve the ferry service. Some other more specific comments were gathered, including that there should be more long-stay car parking, and that bus services should fit in with plane travel times.

4.6.2.2 Inter-Island Transport

In response to the inter-islands air and ferry services, 12 people specified that they use the inter-islands ferry.

The main purpose for using the inter-islands transport services were visiting friends and family (13 respondents), day trips (11), and shopping (7). Other uses included work/attending meetings (4), taking visitors on tours of the isles (2), medical trips and other appointments (2), trips to school (1) and holidays (1).

Those who use the inter-islands ferry or air services recalled very few problems or difficulties travelling on the services, as shown by the fact that only 3 people stated that they had experienced any problems, and 17 people stated that they had not. These problems largely related to bad weather disrupting services. Another comment, although not directly related to the ferry or air services, was that the present bus on the North Isles daily service was believed to be unsuitable to the task as it has not got the capacity to carry shopping or luggage. It was said that it was important to acquire a larger bus for this route, particularly during the tourism season.

When asked what users would like to see improved on the inter-islands ferry services, the replacement of ferries with tunnels was suggested. Parity on all main inter-island ferries for the Christmas and New Year service was also stated, as currently there is no parity, particularly on the Whalsay service. One person suggested cheaper air fares on the inter-island flights, whilst another added that a better information service should be provided during bad weather.

4.6.2.3 Internal Transport

It was found that the vast majority of respondents travel around their local area by car. For example, 36 out of the 38 questionnaires stated that they travelled by car. This is a surprising result as it was anticipated that the library van questionnaire would specifically capture the views of those who are most deprived in relation to accessibility, although the results show that this is clearly not the case. The next most common mode of local travel was walking (17 respondents), followed by bus (9), community transport (4), taxi (2), and cycle (2).

Respondents were next asked to comment on any problems that they faced with any of the modes cited above. The vast majority of comments related to problems caused by snow and icy roads, such as that there is no gritter in some areas until 9am, and that the snow plough actually leads to the blocking of smaller routes, as captured in the comment from one respondent given below:

"With snow, my access to the main road is regularly blocked by the material piled up by the snow plough. A cleared main road is no use if I cannot get onto it without extensive shovelling, which is not a recommended pensioner activity".

Other comments included the expensive cost of taxis.

There was approximately a 50/50 split when respondents were asked if there were any ways that the bus service could be improved. Those who suggested that it could be improved supported this with comments that there was no service in their area and that there was a need for more buses. There appeared to be a specific issue over the lack of transport to Levenwick Medical Centre from Sandwick. It was stated that appointments cannot be fitted in with the existing bus sevice. An afternoon service in many areas would also be welcomed as it was said that buses were too infrequent. For instance, one respondent stated, *"There is a poor service to Lerwick. I can get in for 0900 and out at 1705 but nothing else"*. On the other hand, some respondents stated that *"condsidering the few folk who use it, it is extremely good"*. However, it should be noted that many people did not answer this question because they did not use the bus.

When asked if there were any ways that walking could be made safer or easier. Around 16 people said yes and only 5 people said no. Comments included that there should be more pavements or all weather verges, more speed limit signs and enforcement of the speed limits, particularly around shools. The need for footpaths was specifically recommended on routes to schools and ferry terminals.

The final question asked respondents if there were any problems related to roads and car-use in their area. Comments included poor road condition in certain areas, narrow roads, problems related to speeding drivers, blind corners and the spacing and placing of passing places on single track roads. The problem of speeding was noted as a particularly prominent problem on the route to Vidlin when the Whalsay ferry is diverted there, as drivers speed past a school and some dangerous junctions.

4.6.2.4 Conclusion

In conclusion, the library van questionnaire has reemphasised many of the findings already established through the other consultation means such as the Community Council meetings and the Your Voice Surveys.

4.7 SIC Website Questionnaires

4.7.1 Introduction

A further part of the consultation involved questionnaires being placed on SIC's website. These were available to anybody to complete who accessed the RTS consultation web page on the main SIC site. A copy of the questionnaire is attached as Appendix F. In total, only 2 responses to this questionnaire were received.

4.7.2 Findings

4.7.2.1 External Transport

The only use made of external links was the ferry twice a year for the purpose of leisure and holiday breaks by one respondent. It was thought that existing levels of transport off the islands was sufficient for the needs of the people using them. The ferry was thought to be clean and affordable, however, there was a problem with cabin availability. It was thought that Sumburgh Airport is difficult to get to and from. It was suggested that cheaper air fares, larger ferries and a regular link to Norway would make the biggest improvement to external links to and from Shetland.

4.7.2.2 Inter Island Transport

Both respondents to the questionnaire made use of the inter island ferry links regularly, but not the inter island air links. It was thought that for the most part the ferry services are good, and that they were safe and clean. However, it was thought that the ferries were prone to disruption due to the weather conditions, and due to technical breakdown. They are also thought to be expensive, particularly for young people and those on low incomes. In addition, the festive timetable does not allow for people that have to work, which is a great inconvenience. The ferry renewal programme also appears to be a costly and poorly thought out operation that will result in higher user costs. It was thought that improvements could be made by reducing or removing fares on the ferries. A further improvement that was desired was a timetable for the festive period that suited those people that still had to work. Later night services working on a booking only basis were also desired, as was less disruption due to the weather and technical difficulties.

4.7.2.3 Internal Transport

The main mode of internal transport was by private car. It was therefore not possible for either respondent to answer the questions on public transport provision.

4.7.3 Conclusion

These questionnaires have highlighted again some of the problems that have been identified as being significant in terms of transport both to and from Shetland and within the islands from other consultation sources.

4.8 Have Your Say Discussion Forum

Have Your Say (<u>http://www.myshetland.org.uk/haveyoursay/</u>) is an internet based discussion forum that allows web-users to discuss a broad range of topics Shetland related. In November

2005, a Transport Strategy thread was posted onto the website in an attempt to trigger responses.

As an open discussion forum, comments tended to react to those that had gone previous and this led to some interesting and passionate debate. In particular, the discussions centred around the reality that it will be difficult to provide a good public transport service in Shetland given the dominance of the car. It is also important to pick up that there is a public realisation that transport cannot solve all society's problems and that a holistic approach to some of Shetland problems is required. The bullets below paraphrase some of the main comments from the thread.

- "There is an assumption that at the heart of our investment in Smyril Line that better transport links will result in development. I suspect the link isn't so straight forward. What about all the end of the road communities that are gradually dying? Putting in roads hasn't saved them. Improved transport links would need to sit within a holistic development strategy that focused also on issues like why some folk can't afford to go south, haven't got cars, and can't easily access work or training. Addressing these issues might provide better returns (than large capital schemes such as investment in Smyril Line)".
- "Wasn't a 'holistic development strategy' supposed to have been the Councils Corporate Plan, and its Local Plan. This seems to be yet another reinvention of the wheel!!"
- "I would like a ferry to Aberdeen that has enough beds for me to get one in the summer without having to book 6 months ahead."
- "...Controversially I say scrap the boat and plough all that cash into cheaper flights. Then
 we can make up the difference by hiring cars in Aberdeen! And those who cannot drive can
 get better access to public transport in Aberdeen"
- "Since we have this status (RTP), I think Shetland should only have internal flights to Fair Isle, Skerries and Foula."
- "We all know the majority of people in Shetland use private transport. People like the independence this gives them to make frequent journeys over long distances when they require. In a place where there is a population of 23,000 spread over a relatively large geographical distance the public transport is never going to be all that frequent. Most people who for whatever reason cannot drive can usually call on someone they know to give them a lift for various errands. And, yes, there are undoubtedly those who fall through that net but this is when social care should kick in and transport should be one of the needs catered for by that service."
- "The majority of people may use private transport but petrol is getting more expensive and no one suggests this will reverse...Many with private transport can't afford to use it willy nilly therefore availability of good public transport services is not an issue of minority concern...How good would it have to get so we could stop building ever bigger ferries for the petrol heads or should we subsidise them indefinitely because they can afford cars and therefore are so much more important than people who can't afford to run them?"
- "The cars I see parked at junctions along the Lang Kaimes suggest a lot of folk are car sharing or commuting along arterial routes by bus. This suggests in turn that not all car owners choose to use them for every trip. Owning a car is expensive enough for many folk. Running them for every journey can be prohibitive. Good public transport services therefore can help many folk and I'm sure if our ferries weren't so heavily subsidised many more folk would walk on and bus off. Buses also create less ware and tear on the roads reducing that hidden subsidy to the car driver."
- "p.s. 1/4 of people have mental health problems during their life time. We've got to get beyond a position that assumes provision of decent public services only relates to the marginalised in our community. Folk can find themselves careless for a whole variety of reasons."

5.1 Introduction

In closing, this final chapter summarises the main findings from the consultation process as a whole.

5.2 External Transport

Reported problems with the external ferry service tended to centre around a lack of cabin space on board the NorthLink ferries. However, many consultees recognised that NorthLink Ferries offerred an excellent service, much improved from the previous service operated by P&O Scottish Ferries. It was also recognised that capacity constraints on the service could be taken as a sign that NorthLink have been a victim of their own success.

To overcome the capacity constraints, there were calls for some of the leisure space on the ferries to be replaced with more cabins. It was also proposed that capacity problems could be overcome through the adjustment of travel times and operation of shuttle runs to reduce the time spent in harbour. It was also suggested that Shetland should have its own ferry service to Aberdeen as NorthLink are trying to run two services in one by sailing to Orkney as well as Shetland.

Considerable debate also took place over the future mainland port destination for the NorthLink ferries, particularly in light of reports suggesting that it could be more efficient to run two larger vessels to ports other than Aberdeen.

It was noted that Aberdeen had some advantages, such as a shorter crossing than Rosyth, easy access to the town centre, strong cultural connections, and easy access to rail, coach and air links. Recent growth on the route could confirm its suitability. However, disadvantages of Aberdeen were noted to be the size of its berth which could limit the length of alternative ferries, and some delays due to tidal conditions/prevailing north-easterly winds.

Advantages of alternative ports were the ability to provide berths for larger vessels, and if located to the south of Aberdeen, easier access to the central belt. A link to Rosyth was also thought to be beneficial as it could provide some connections with the Superfast ferry to Zeebrugge. Disadvantages with alternative ports were mainly poorer access than Aberdeen for public transport, town centres, and (for Peterhead) poorer road access.

The prevailing view from the community councils was that, on balance, Aberdeen should be retained as the mainland port, whilst there was a desire to see the pros and cons of other arrangements considered.

Problems with the facilities for passengers were also noted, for example no left luggage facility at Aberdeen Harbour. Parking problems at Aberdeen Harbour were also highlighted.

The vast majortiy of comments on the external air service centred around the high and variable air fares. The introduction of PSOs was a commonly suggested solution to overcome this problem. However, as alluded to in the introduction to this report, there have been many developments since this report has been produced, namely the announcement from the Scottish Executive that air fares on the Highlands and Islands air network would be reduced by an estimated 40 per cent. Consequently, it is believed that the high costs of air fares would not have been such a prominent issue in this report had the consultation exercise been undertaken following this announcement.

Other comments on the air service related to timetable constraints to certain destinations. For example, a higher frequency of service to Inverness would be welcomed. Some limitations with the operating hours of Sumburgh Airport were also noted. The baggage allowance on Loganair

flights was also said to be limiting as was the lack of overhead locker room. Loganair's dealings with customers when flights are delayed, and the lack of parking spaces at Sumburgh Airport were further criticisms raised in relation to external air links during consultation.

With regards to Scatsta Airport, there were calls (mainly from those in the northern parts of Shetland) for this to be used as Shetland's main airport, although there was a general acceptance that Sumburgh would remain as Shetland's main airport given the development of the runway extension. Nevertheless, there was strong support for the use of Scatsta as a diversionary airport.

On the whole, there was generally a high level of satisfaction with the current air service both in terms of frequency of service and range of destinations. The introduction of flights to Standsted was viewed positively and it was hoped that this move may stimulate other air service providers to introduce flights to and from Shetland.

5.3 Inter Island Transport

In short, the inter-island air service was strongly commended during consultation. For some islands, particuarly Fair Isle and Foula, the air service is seen as a life-line link that must be maintained. The flexible attitude of pilots to the timetables was commended as was the proactive approach taken to support the islands. There was support for the recent drop in air fares, and flight costs are now believed to be quite reasonable.

In some islands, there was a desire for more frequent flights as it was suggested that there can be capacity problems during peak periods.

It was widely recognised that SIC provide a rolls-royce inter island ferry service and that the ferry services play a key role in sustaining people on the islands. However, the view was expressed that the inter island ferries are too expensive to run in terms of running and replacement costs. Some also thought that ticket prices were too high, whilst others recognised that, compared to other areas in Scotland, fare levels were very favourable.

Whilst some criticised the level of subsidy that went into sustaining some of the small isles of Shetland, others were aware that in the same way some Shetland Mainland residents view the isles as just peripheral isles that are being over-subsidised, the same view could be held of Shetland as a whole by people on the Scottish Mainland

Furthermore, specific gaps in timetables were noted on some services along with some identified booking problems and capacity constraints. In addition, the information provided on the electronic information notice boards is thought to be at best unhelpful. The Voicebank service often has incorrect or out of date information. Better facilities for people waiting for ferries was thought to be essential, with some locations not having a basic waiting room. However, it is to be noted that SIC have already started to address some of the issues identified above, such as through upgrading the VMS control software to provide opportunities to display further information.

With regards to the issue of fixed links, consultation revealed strong support for the development of a fixed link (tunnel) between Yell and Unst. It was believed that there is a "50/50" split on the development of a fixed link between Shetland Mainland and Yell.

5.4 Internal Transport

With regards to walking, a common point raised during consultation was the lack of footpaths in rural areas. It was accepted that it is not possible to provide full tarmac footpaths throughout Shetland, and nor would this be welcomed. However, there was support for the implementation of a basic hard surface or 'French drain' in rural areas to provide walkers with a safe pedestrian refuge on a surface that retains the rural feel of the area.

It was acknowldeged that it is very difficult to provide a frequent public transport service throughout Shetland given the population dispersal patterns on the island. Depsite this, it was recognised that Shetland has a very good public transport service.

However, numerous examples were highlighted where buses do not serve the needs of the local population or where buses only suit the requirements of "9 to 5" workers in Lerwick. The need for more evening, late night and weekend buses was also highlighted. Drink-driving was considered to be a particularly significant problem in Shetland and it is felt that the provision of late night buses could help alleviate this problem.

There was support for the shopper's services that have been implemented across Shetland and an extension to the shopper's bus network was thought to be a good idea. The introduction of dial-a-ride bus services is also viewed as an initiative that appeared to have great support throughout Shetland. The Tingwall dial-a-ride taxi was one such initiative that was given widespread backing by all who had used it.

Other comments related to pubic transport provision were that greater consideration should be given to tourists when planning bus routes as not all people travelling to Shetland have a car, and in general there is poor provision for those without access to a car. The need for better integration between bus timetables was also suggested, particularly the bus timetables between the north and south of Mainland Shetland.

Concerns were also raised over the limited bus service that operates to some health centres, particularly the health centre in Levenwick.

With regards to roads and road safety, the road network was not thought to present any significant problems, though there are some local issues which could reportedly benefit from reduced speed limits, more passing places, and resurfacing works. The road to the west side of Shetland was stated to be the main route that required improvement.

In addition, a number of consultees highlighted a lack of parking in Lerwick as a problem, particularly at the Holmsgarth ferry terminal and Victoria Pier.

Speeding and drink driving were identified as major problems across Shetland. There was widespread support for the imposition of 20mph zones around schools, although it is also felt that these limits will not be adhered to without appropriate physical traffic calming measures. It was also felt that there should be more encouragement for parents and pupils to walk or cycle to school where appropriate.

SIC's winter maintenance programme is believed to be an extremely good service according to most consultees, although there were some specific areas where there were complaints that the gritting is not done early enough in the morning.

On a wider issue, there is a growing concern over the rising costs of fuels, and subsequently it was suggested that SIC push for differential fuel taxation.

5.5 Conclusion

In closing, the consultation process has proved invaluable in identifying current issues, problems and opportunities that the RTS must address. It is believed that the extensive nature of the consultation process has allowed for a strong base of information to be gathered, and places the RTS in a strong position moving forward. Another benefit of the consultation process is that it has allowed for stakeholder buy-in to the RTS, and it is essential that there is a strong perception of local responsibility for the RTS if it is to be developed and implemented effectively.

Appendix A: Consultation Checklist

Consultee	Date of Meeting
Shetland Islands Council	
Housing - Alison Christie	26 th Oct 05
Education - Jim Reyner	20 Oct 05
Child Care Partnership	11 th Nov 05
Social Work	22 nd Nov 05
Health Board	15 th Sep 05
Shetland Enterprise	15 th Sep 05 27 th Oct 05
HIE - Tony Jarvis	27 Oct 05 29 th Nov 05
HIE - Tony Jarvis	29 100 05
Businesses – Transport	
StreamLine	26 th Oct 05
Northwards	26 th Oct 05
HIAL Sumburgh Airport	1 st Nov 05
JBT – Shetland	2 nd Nov 05
John Leask and Sons	3 rd Nov 05
Loganair Pilot	8 th Nov 05
NorthLink Ferries	14 th Nov 05
RG Jamieson Cullivoe	15 th Nov 05
Loganair Headquarters	28 th Nov 05
Lerwick Port Authority	30 th Nov 05
JBT – Aberdeen	30 th Jan 05
Aberdeen Harbour Board	7 th Feb 06
Businesses - Seafood	anth a rear
Shetland Catch	26 th Oct 05
Seafood Shetland	3 rd Nov 05
Shetland Aquaculture	3 rd Nov 05
SNPC	15 th Nov 05
Trouw Aquaculture	1 st Dec 05
East Vie Shellfish	1 st Dec 05
Blydoit Fish Ltd	1 st Dec 05
Unst Oyst	13 th Dec 05
Johnson Seafarms	19 th Dec 05
Shetland Fish Products	20 th Dec 05
Businesses – Livestock	
GB and AM Anderson	3 rd Nov 05
National Farmers' Union	24 th March 06
Crofters' Foundation	4 th April 06
Public Sector Service	26 th Oct 05
Fire Brigade	
Brae Health Centre	18 th Nov 05
Royal Mail	23 rd Nov 05
Police	23 rd Nov 05
Ambulance Service	23 rd Nov 05
Tourism	

Tourist Information	2 nd Nov 05
Moussa Boat Trips	7 th Dec 05
Business – Other	
MK Leslie (Keith Leslie)	18 th Nov 05
Valhalla Brewery	13 th Dec 05
Unst Inshore Services	13 th Dec 05
BP Sullom Voe	19 th Dec 05
PURE Project	17 th Jan 06
Voluntary Sector	
WRVS	13 th Oct 05
EAL Group	27 th Oct 05
Disability Shetland	27 th Oct 05
Youth Groups	
Young Voice Executive	26 th Oct 05
Shetland Youth Information Service (Karen Smith and Young	17 th Nov 05
People)	17 ¹¹ Nov 05
Brae Youth Conference	8 th Dec 05
Retail Sector	
Retailers Association	3 rd Nov 05
Education	
Shetland College	2 nd Nov 05
Ollaberry Primary School	16 th Nov 05
Brae High School	18 th Nov 05
Anderson High School	24 th Jan 06
Public Consultation Events	
Flu Fair Consultation – Lerwick	25 th Oct 05
IATE Event – North Isles	19 th Nov 05
Communities – Islands	
Skerries	
Evening Consultation	31 st Oct 05
Fish Processing	31 st Oct 05
School	31 st Oct 05
Post Office	31 st Oct 05
Foula	
Evening Consultation	7 th Nov 05
Davie Sanderson	7 th Nov 05
Martin Kennedy	8 th Nov 05
Amy Ratter	7 th Nov 05
Isobel Holburn	7 th Nov 05
	,
Fair Isle	
Evening Consultation	9 th Nov 05
Jimmy Stout	10 th Nov 05
Holly Shaw	10 th Nov 05
	10 INOV 05

Dave Wheeler	10 th Nov 05
Philip Welch	10 th Nov 05
Fiona and Robert Mitchell	10 th Nov 05
Jilly Harrison (Fair Isle Primary)	9 th Nov 05
Fetlar	
Evening Consultation	12 th Dec 05
Fetlar Interpretative Centre	14 th Nov 05
Fetlar School Head Teacher	15 th Nov 05
Fetlar School Secretary	15 th Nov 05
Fetlar School Cook	15 th Nov 05
RSPB Fetlar	15 th Nov 05
John Coutts, CC Chairman	15 th Nov 05
Vall	
Yell Evening Consultation	21 st Nov 05
Evening Consultation	21 Nov 05 21 st Nov 05
Mid Yell Nursery Peerie Briggs - Toddler Group (Lesley Grey)	21 Nov 05 21 st Nov 05
reene briggs - roddier Group (Lesiey Grey)	CU VURI IS
Unst	
Evening Consultation	17 th Jan 06
Unst Transport Forum	5 th Dec 05
Unst Response Team	6 th Dec 05
Whalsay	
Evening Consultation	25 th Jan 06
	20 041100
Bressay	
Evening Consultation	21 st Dec 05
Papa Stour	
Mr and Mrs Strickland	7 th Dec 05
Mr and Mrs Holt-Brooks	7 th Dec 05
Questionnaires	Various
Communities – Mainland	
Northmavine	
Evening Consultation	8 th Dec 05
	0 200 00
Delting	
Evening Consultation	17 th Nov 05
Nesting and Lunnasting	
Evening Consultation	30 th Nov 05
Tingwall, Whiteness and Weisdale	
Evening Consultation	22 nd Nov 05
Sandeting and Aitheting	
Sandsting and Aithsting Evening Consultation	6 th Dec 05
Sandness and Walls	
	I

Evening Consultation	13 th Dec 05
Scalloway	
Evening Consultation	1 st Dec 05
Burra and Trondra	
Evening Consultation	23 rd Jan 06
Lerwick	
Evening Consultation	19 th Dec 05
Gulberwick, Cunningsburgh and Quarff	
Evening Consultation	20 th Dec 05
Sandwick	
Evening Consultation	7 th Dec 05
Dunrossness	
Evening Consultation	24 th Jan 06

Appendix B: Problems/Opportunities As Stated During Consultation

Consultee Problems Matrix: Internal Links

Consultee	Internal Transport							
Group	Roads	Walking and Cycling Public Transport	Other Issues					
Mainland CCs	Young drivers speeding in Lerwick.	 Cycling is dangerous in Lerwick. There is a need to get car-users more aware of cyclists, as cycling is illegal on pavements and cyclists need to cycle on roads, which is dangerous. There should be better integration between bus and flight timetables. Late flights do not connect with buses. 	 Street lighting is too bright and many locals are anti-street lighting in order to retain the area's rural feel. 					
	20mph limits in certain areas will not work in the absence of traffic calming.	Congestion around schools caused by It is felt there is a need for more off peak buses.	Rising fuel costs are concerning.					
	Road surface in Lerwick is poorer than elsewhere in Shetland.	 In Gulberwick, there is a little continuous footpath, and this is becoming a problem with more and more houses being built in the area. The lack of timetables at bus stops was a big problem in the past. 	recently, there will probably never be enough parking spaces.					
	There is a lack of co-ordination over the digging up of sections of road in Lerwick.	 Lack of pedestrian provision in Sandsting and Aithsting area and Nesting and Lunnasting When planning buses, greater consideration should be given to tourists as not everyone travelling to Shetland hire a car. 	Airport, especially during the peak summer period.					
	The road to North Roe is in urgent need of improvement.	 School transport does not serve after school clubs 	There are parking problems at Holmsgarth ferry terminal.					
	Too much heavy (in terms of weight) traffic through Delting	 Poor provision for those without access to cars. 	parents dropping off and picking up pupils (similar problem at Sandwick Junior High).					
	Road safety is said to be an issue in Quarff with the main spine road running through the settlement.	According to consultees, there is no service through the lower parts of Cunningsburgh.	Air ambulance helicopter if stationed offshore could take a long time to get to people who need help					
	Layout and design of some roads (i.e. absence of trees) encourages speeding on certain roads, especially the spinal road south from Lerwick to Sumburgh.	Concerns over limited bus service that operates to Levenwick Health Centre						
	The blind corner at Hillside is one area where improvements would be welcomed. This corner is not safe, especially with turning buses.	 Reduced services at weekends (i.e. first Saturday bus from Sandwick to Lerwick runs almost an hour later than the normal weekday service). 						
	A968 has a high accident toll	 Lack of mid evening buses at weekends. 						
	Main Street, Scalloway not good for buses and trucks	 Sandwick to Lerwick buses are very busy and the buses used on the route are designed for the country roads. 						
	Not enough parking in Lerwick	 No services in Mossbank to link with Brae for Health Centre, school etc. 						
	Roads in the west of Mainland not as good as everywhere else	Not enough taxis in Delting area						
	No safety barriers in Nesting and Lunnasting area	 Taxis charge for a return journey if you are travelling from Delting to Lerwick 						
	Additional traffic generated by potential new development of Blackwood's distillery a problem in Nesting and Lunnasting area	Timetable for the north doesn't match with the timetable for the south						
	Gritting not done early enough in the day	 Problems finding new bus drivers No shopper service in Whalsay. 						
		Some bus stops require better lighting						

Consultee Problems Matrix: Internal Links

Consultee		Internal Tr	ansport	
Group	Roads	Walking and Cycling	Public Transport	Other Issues
North Isles CCs	•	No pedestrian provision near school on Fetlar	Difficult to arrange health appointments around public transport timetables	
Bressay CC	Lack of footpath from the ferry terminal to the Maryfield Hotel.			• Parking problems related to tourist coaches visiting the island.
				 Limited parking space and cost of parking at Victoria Pier prevents Bressay residents from having a mainland car in addition to an island car.
Whalsay and Skerries CCs	It was believed that roads in Whalsay are the worst in Shetland.	Walking is dangerous in some areas where there is nowhere for walkers to go if two cars pass each other.	There is a lack of connecting transport at Vidlin for passengers from Skerries.	Parking is very restrictive at Vidlin. There is also a lack of lining at Vidlin.
	 Speeding cars is a problem on Whalsay, although it is believed that the police are addressing this and the introduction of speed limits in specific areas will make a difference. 	The narrowness of the single road caused problems for pedestrians.		
	 The road from Laxo to Vidlin is very poor and can be dangerous. There are few passing places on this road, and concerns arise when ferries are diverted to Vidlin. 			
	 The width of the island road, particularly on a number of blind corners e.g. by the bridge, past the school, the cemetery, and on the approach to the harbour, were said to be the main problems for car drivers. 			
Small Islands	Limited provision of passing places on Fair Isle	Lack of walking provision on narrow roads in Fair Isle	Lack of services from Lerwick to West Burrafirth for Papa Stour ferry	 Concern over delivery companies (e.g.TNT, Securicor) not delivering to islands and therefore undercutting Royal Mail and that this might force Royal Mail to cut back service
Community Groups/ Voluntary			Not enough services on Sundays	Need for greater information sharing and communication and working together to pool resources
Groups			Walking distances to bus stops are too long	 Acquiring a blue disabled badge is a long drawn out process
				Need for organisations to sort out transport problems relating to policy such as methadone patients to receive drugs between 9am and 10am
Transport Operators	 Young drivers on Unst should require a full licence before being allowed to drive unaided Not enough man power on Fair Isle to maintain roads 	Need for a path from Nicoforlea to the school	Lack of infrastructure for low floor buses	 Getting parts to Unst more difficult as the haulage company is reducing the number of runs it makes in a week
SIC (housing and education)				Too expensive to transport housing materials to remote areas
				 Lack of drivers for specialist vehicles Cost of special events for children becomes very high when transportation taken into account

Consultee Problems Matrix: Internal Links

Consultee	Internal Transport							
Group		Roads		Walking and Cycling		Public Transport		Other Issues
Schools	•	Parents dropping children off don't use drop off zones at Brae High School	•	Need for walking and cycling paths in Brae	•	School buses don't provide service for after school clubs	٠	Activities and trips are curbed due to the cost of transport, as is training for teachers
	٠	Lower speed limit at Ollaberry PS	•	Need for walking and cycling paths at	•	It is understood that Train Shetland have		
	•	Concern over speed of vehicles in Brae		Ollaberry PS		accommodating people from outer areas who use public transport to get into Lerwick and can't do a full day's training as buses, ferries etc don't allow enough time		
Youth Groups			•	Pedestrian areas in Lerwick still allow vehicles to drive through them e.g. to get to the bank	•	Drivers do not see people standing at bus stops		
					٠	Bus drivers overcharge young people		
					•	Not enough buses in Whalsay and Unst		
Health/ Care Centres/ Old					•	Patients have to sit and wait in surgery for bus for hours	•	Query over who is responsible for transporting patients home after treatment
People							•	Problem attracting staff in rural areas, transport thought to be a problem in this
							•	Transport of patients to the day care centres is a problem
							•	Patients can only claim cost of travel to health care retrospectively, not get the money in advance
Others	٠	General level of driving in Shetland is poor					٠	Police and fire have headquarters in Inverness
	•	Drink driving a major problem						so better transport to Inverness would be beneficial

Consultee	e Inter-Island Transport Problems									
Group		Inter-islands Ferry service - Passenger	Inter-islands Ferry service – Freight	Inter-islands air service – Passenger	Inter-islands air service – Freight	Fixed Links				
Mainland CCs		Expensive to run (running and replacement costs). Ticket prices too high		<u>_</u>		 If developed, they should not take as long to implement as the proposed Bressay Bridge. 				
North Isles CCs	•	Not enough ferries at weekend between Fetlar and Yell				proposed bressay bridge.				
		New Bluemull Sound timetable not as good as previous one								
	•	No breakwater at Hamars Ness Electronic message boards don't give useful information and are often out of date								
		Capacity problems on certain ferries, particularly at peak times and during events.								
		Ferry timetable between Fetlar and Yell and Yell and Mainland are not integrated								
		Concern over loss of ferry jobs if ferry services are put out to tender Living in Unst was said to make it impossible								
	1	to catch early flights from Sumburgh. Unst ferry constrains tourism opportunities								
		during the summer peaks. Timetable can be confusing								
	•	Weekend visitors to the island can be discouraged by a lack of sailings for getting back off the island.								
Bressay CC		Bressay ferry could be better integrated with other transport services, and specifically the first flight out of Sumburgh.	High costs involved in transportation of construction materials by ferry.			 Concern that Bressay fixed link could lead to an inappropriate increase of housing on the island. 				
		Fares on the Bressay ferry are believed to be unfair because residents of other isles on Shetland are enabled to own two cars through free parking on Shetland Mainland. Bressay residents also share many facilities (i.e. schools and leisure facilities) with Lerwick.				•				

Consultee		Inter-Isl	Inter-Island Transport Problems						
Group	Inter-islands Ferry service - Passenger	Inter-islands Ferry service – Freight	Inter-islands air service – Passenger	Inter-islands air service – Freight	Fixed Links				
Whalsay and Skerries CCs	Problems discussed as part of the Whalsay Links study were said to still stand.								
	 Skerries community felt let down by the "lack of action" and progress on the south mouth. 								
	 Distress is caused when the ferry sets out in "border-line" conditions, only to reach Skerries, and then having to turn back to the Mainland due to conditions in the Northeast Mouth. 								
	• There is a perceived lack of flexibility and commitment to the island by the ferry crew, who are based on Whalsay.								
	Chairs in the saloon are unsuitable and uncomfortable.								
	There is concern that the Bressay Bridge / fixed link will result in the dock at Lerwick being closed and that the Skerries ferry will only travel to Vidlin.								
Small Islands	Foula ferry provides a journey that is slow and uncomfortable		 Booking system at Loganair allows short notice cancellations, but does not facilitate a stand-by facility for "no shows". 						
	Ferry services to Papa Stour benefits the visitors and not the locals		Air fares are too expensive to Foula						
	 Concerns if mini tour operators book a minibus onto the Papa Stour ferry as this could prevent residents or essential service providers from travelling into Papa Stour at the same time. 		Service can be unreliable, mainly due to weather issues.						
Transport Providers	Potential future problem with berthing larger boats at Grutness		 Lack of space on Fair Isle plane in the summer, during the main birding season 						
	Global warming related sea level rises may lead to a requirement for a new piers		Route from Fair Isle to Orkney not thought viable for logistical						
	Concern that too regular a service to Fair Isle would mean that tourists wouldn't bring as		reasons Concern over future VFR flight						
	much of a benefit to the island		regulations Tendering process is uncertain						
Industry		 Gap in sailings on Yell Sound between 12.45 and 13.55 Lack of sailings to Bressay after 10.30pm causes problems 	<u>,</u>						
Schools	No waiting room at Gutcher		 Pupils at Anderson from Fair Isle have to miss a Friday afternoon classes to travel home and Monday morning to get back to school on current timetables 						

Consultee Problems Matrix: External Links

Consultee	External Transport								
Group	Air - Passenger	Air – Freight	Sea – Passenger	Sea – Freight					
Mainland CCs	Lack of competition at Sumburgh Airport leads to high flight costs.		Aberdeen harbour considered too small for the largest possible future ferries	Disappointing that Smyril Line no longer stopping at Lerwick in the winter.					
	 Inflexibility of Loganair in terms of ticket refundability. 		NorthLink ferries are not big enough. There are capacity problems caused by a lack of cabins at peak periods.	 Concern over any competition to Royal Mail, as they offer an excellent service as opposed to specialist delivery service. 					
			Dissatisfaction raised about the left luggage arrangement on the NorthLink ferries	Problem getting perishable goods off the islands when the NorthLink boat is out of service					
	Concern about the use of smaller SAAB aircrafts during peak periods.		Not enough parking for NorthLink customers in Aberdeen.						
	Not enough flights at the weekend		 On the NorthLink ferries, it can be cheaper for 2 people to book a 4 berth cabin with no window, than it would be for them to book a 2 berth cabin with a window. 						
	Flights susceptible to weather and technical delays and cancellations		 If travelling without a cabin, there are no showers, which is a problem. 						
	Baggage allowance not enough, less than on the rest of the British Airways network		There are concerns that the lack of contingency in the Smyril Line timetable could increase the chance of Lerwick losing the Smyril Line in the future.						
	 Not a good service form Loganair when flights are cancelled in terms of looking after passengers 		Problem with the allocation of cabins on						
	Sumburgh Airport not allowed to have flights landing or taking off until 7.30am		 Problems booking tickets through UK Mainland travel agents 						
			Dissatisfaction that the ferry leaves early some nights to sail to Orkney before Aberdeen						
			NorthLink from Scottish Executive subsidy is too high						
North Isles CCs	Range and variable prices make it difficult to budget for trips			 Livestock needs to be accounted for – this was missing from last tendering process 					

Consultee Problems Matrix: External Links

Consultee			External Transport	
Group	Air - Passenger	Air – Freight	Sea – Passenger	Sea – Freight
Whalsay and Skerries CCs	 The difficulty of changing tickets was emphasised. It was said to be unfair that children aged 13 are classed as an adult, when normally adult fares aren't required until aged 16. 		 There are problems at Aberdeen Harbour and it is believed that there have been no serious attempts to improve the mouth of the harbour. 	
Transport Operators	 Problems with check in staff at Edinburgh and Aberdeen airports Regional twin prop air operators viewed as being less important at major airports Length of runway at Sumburgh a problem Fog and wind problems at Sumburgh Airport are a problem HIAL charge for keeping airport open for delayed planes Logistical difficulties with using Scatsta as a diversionary airport to Sumburgh Effective way to subsidise air transport has not yet been found Current fares are paralysing the tourism trade in Shetland. 		 NorthLink service has become a victim of its own success. There can be problems getting into the cafeteria on the NorthLink boats. There are communication problems related to the Noronna. The booking system is said to be diabolical and it is felt that Smyril Line do not want to market Shetland. 	
Industry	Air services to Inverness do not have useful timings	Air freight too expensive to use regularly		 Problems due to weather – especially with regard to fresh produce No cheap direct viable link to Orkney Not a level playing field between NorthLink and other (smaller) operators as NorthLink freight is to be heavily subsidised NorthLink difficult in dealing with for getting freight onto the passenger ferry High costs involved in transport of livestock to Mainland Scotland.
Young People	Doesn't make sense not allowed to use ferry on own if under 16 but can use plane		 Have to pay extra to take different vehicle back on ferry e.g. if bought new car in Aberdeen Staff on ferry don't have much patience with young people 	

Consultee Suggestions: Internal Links

Consultee	onsultee Internal Transport				
Group	Roads	Walking and Cycling	Public Transport	Other Issues	
Mainland CCs	Improvements to road surface in Lerwick.	 Support for the establishment of 20mph zones outside schools. 	Reintroduction of complementary minibuses by flight operators if flights are late.	stops.	
	Improvements to North Roe road.	 Support for traffic calming in tandem with reduced speed limits. 	stop has a timetable, along with maps.	taxation.	
	 Support and continue roads maintenance program. 	 Develop methods to get parents to use other modes (than by car) to take their children to school. 		Extra lighting at Swinister Bridge, Sandwick.	
	 Support and continue the winter roads maintenance programme. 	 Rather than develop full concrete footpaths, implement a basic hard surface or 'French drain' in rural areas so to provide walkers with a safe pedestrian refuge on a surface that retains the rural feel of the area. 	introduce a day ticket	There is a need for better communication and wider availability of the mobile bank timetable.	
	Reduce speed limit to 40mph on single track roads	 Introduce a lower speed limit (i.e. 20mph) on a part-time basis in Cunningsburgh around the school and village hall area. 		Patient transport service in Delting area	
	Traffic lights at Whiteness School	Speed limits should be lower through Brae and Mossbank	Extension of shoppers bus services	More Parking in Scalloway where skateboard area currently is and at Scalloway Castle	
		 Lack of footpaths in the Delting area Walkway to Tingwall and Tingwall Valley 	Have a pool of car drivers for driving people around who don't have access to a car		
		Underpass to Clickimin Centre			
North Isles CCs			A park and ride scheme should be established for tourists travelling to Unst, and a lift share scheme could be introduced for any commuters using the ferry.		
			An earlier commuter bus service from Unst should be trialled.		
			The introduction of a dial a ride service in order to transport people to the Hamers Ness terminal would be useful.		
Bressay CC			• Extension of the Lerwick Shopper's bus to the peripheries of Bressay.		
Whalsay and Skerries CCs	 The provision of white lines, signs, or roadside mirrors On Skerries would help to encourage drivers to keep to the left of the carriageway at the blind corners. 	 The provision of footpaths in and around lbister is desirable. 	Introduce a dial-a-ride scheme, similar to the "book ahead" taxi service to Tingwall, in order to overcome the problems of limited transport frequency at Vidlin.		
Small Islands			Introduce demand responsive buses to Sumburgh – Lerwick route	_	
			Support for £1 dial a ride from Tingwall to Lerwick		
Transport Operators			Support for direct bus service from Unst and Yell to Lerwick		
Industry				Have more video conferencing to reduce the need to travel	

Consultee Suggestions: Internal Links

Consultee	Internal Transport					
Group	Roads	Walking and Cycling	Public Transport	Other Issues		
Youth Groups	Roads at Sandwick require repair		20p bus fare for Lerwick town service			
			 Late night bus services to North Mainland 			
			 More buses during the day for Northmaven 			
			 Buses on Friday and Saturday night to south mainland 			
			 Allocated seats for pupils on service buses where there are no school buses as buses often have more than the legally allowed number of people standing on them 			
			Should be able to use Young Scot discount with private taxi firms			
			 On demand service available for young people to access facilities and services at off peak times – Bus services not integrated with youth events 			
			 School buses could be better used to provide services to places, events and facilities 			
			 Information targeted to youths would be beneficial about ways they can save money on public transport 			
Health/ Care Centres/ Old People			Introduce dial-a-ride schemes to provide improved access to health centres.			
Others	More education for drivers.		•	 Disability Shetland have funding to buy minibuses, these could be used by other groups 		

Consultee		Ir	ter-Island Transport		
Group	Inter-islands Ferry service - Passenger	Inter-islands Ferry service – Freight	Inter-islands air service – Passenger	Inter-islands air service – Freight	Fixed Links
Mainland CCs	 Signage at ferry terminals should display positive messages encouraging people to travel to the islands 		 Safeguard the internal air service, which is a community service of critical importance to the small islands, especially during times of emergency. 		 Support for fixed links (especially to Unst and Yell).
	Waiting rooms, cafes and better information should be provided at all waiting rooms		Flexible attitude to timetabling should be commended and adopted with other services.	-	Unanimous support for tunnels to be built
			Support for recent drop in fares on inter-island flight, which are now believed to be quite reasonable. Support for keeping Scatsta airport open	-	 The 'iconic' Bressay Bridge idea should be abandoned in favour of a tunnel.
North Isles CCs	Sound ferries		The possibility of an air link to Fetlar was considered to be good.		
	There is a desire for an Unst based ferry crew				
	Support for fixed links between Yell and Unst				
	Ferry based on Fetlar				
	VMS can be useful – but only if kept up to date.				
	Development of breakwater in Fetlar.				
Bressay CC	A more regular Sunday service would be welcomed.				
Whalsay and Skerries CCs	 More flexible approach should be adopted to running ferry services i.e. sailings at a later time in the day if earlier sailings are cancelled. It would be "nice" to have later ferries operating from Skerries. 				
	There is a longer term priority for the ferry and crew to be based on Skerries.				

Consultee	Inter-Island Transport				
Group	Inter-islands Ferry service - Passenger	Inter-islands Ferry service – Freight	Inter-islands air service – Passenger	Inter-islands air service – Freight	Fixed Links
Small Islands	 When Fair Isle ferry is replaced a slightly bigger, faster, multi function boat would be appreciated Additional summer sailing per week to Fair 	low	 Flight from Fair isle to Orkney Extension of Saturday service to Fair Isle into October. Another return journey on same day to Fair isle Build new Fair Isle air strip on 		
	Isle when the boat is at or near capacity, extend the summer timetable and incrementally reduce the frequency of sailing to winter so there are more services in October		 lower ground to eliminate problem of flights cancelled due to fog Would like Loganair to send confirmation of flights to passengers 		
			 Greater clarification of the Extra Regular Flight (ERF) and Community Bank systems Could offer tourists a cheaper flight if they stay overnight on islands to help promote tourist industry on small islands 		
	 Passenger fares could be increased especially in the summer in order to take advantage of the extra passengers 		 Penalty for people who book flights to islands and don't take them up 		
	 Papa Stour ferry timetable changes, including the provision of a Sunday morning sailing, an additional Monday evening sailing and a later sailing on a Wednesday. 		Voicebank system similar to ferries to advise of problems with flights		
	Foula Co-op scheme.		 Concessionary scheme for people flying from islands to mainland Scotland for the connection from Tingwall to Sumburgh An additional day with an extra return flight on Foula should be 		
			introduced to make it possible to fly to the Mainland and return to Foula on the same day.		

Consultee	Inter-Island Transport					
Group	Inter-islands Ferry service - Passenger	Inter-islands Ferry service – Freight	Inter-islands air service – Passenger	Inter-islands air service – Freight	Fixed Links	
Transport Operators	Proposed to make Fair Isle ferry a working boat and take it out of the Safety Management System		 Possibility of Orkney and Shetland inter island flights being operated together 		 Relief gritter deployed from Yel to Unst during severe weathe conditions 	
	Concern over proposed tunnel link to Bressay		Answering machine in Tingwall office of Loganair			
	• Fair Isle ferry should remain based on the		Flight from Fair isle to Orkney			
	island		Daily flight to Fair Isle			
			Introduction of flights from Unst to Sumburgh.			
			 Potential for improving level of air services to islands. 			
			 Increased regulatory environment could negatively affect the islander air service. 			
Industry		Remove fares on crossings from Mainland to Yell			 Carry out study into the ful implications of fixed links before building them 	
SIC (Housing and Education)					 Bressay bridge would open up more land for housing 	

Consultee Suggestions: External Links

Consultee		External Transport		
Group	Air - Passenger	Air – Freight	Sea – Passenger	Sea – Freight
Mainland CCs	 Increase competition at Sumburgh through the introduction of PSOs. 		Shetland should have its own service as NorthLink are trying to do two services in one by servicing Orkney and Shetland in the same trips.	Use Rosyth instead of Aberdeen as the main destination port for Shetland.
	Extend opening hours of Sumburgh Airport.		Travel times on NorthLink should be adjusted at peak times to cope with the capacity problems.	 Explore opportunities for a yearly freight service to Scandinavia i.e. Faroese receive cargo from Denmark every week and it would be useful to have this service stop in Lerwick now that the Smyril no longer runs.
	Support for the increased frequency of flights from Sumburgh.		 Support for changes to the NorthLink booking system, which now enables passengers to book a single berth. 	 A smaller freight vessel in the winter was recommended for the Smyril Line service
	Support for the introduction of Atlantic Airways flights to Stanstead in the summer.		There should be a short term parking area for passengers to use whilst waiting to board the NorthLink ferries in Aberdeen.	
	 Larger 50 seater aircrafts leased in during the summer months would be recommended to overcome capacity problems during the peak period. 		Support for late night sailing times.	
	 Need for promotion of the Shetland – Stanstead service down south to ensure this service becomes viable and becomes a regular service from Sumburgh. 		Support for the Smyril Line service.	
	 Support for timetabling arrangements that enable return trips to be made in the same day i.e. Aberdeen and now Edinburgh. It is believed that Inverness should be the next destination that will allow Shetlanders to travel to and from on the same day. 		 Support for retaining Aberdeen as the main port because the city also has good air and rail links, whereas there could be delays in Edinburgh. 	
	Scatsta may be a better option than Sumburgh for Shetland's main airport.		Use Rosyth or Invergordon as diversionary ports on occasions when ferries cannot get into Aberdeen Harbour.	
	Support for the use of Tingwall as the main airport for Shetland		Lobby for Aberdeen Harbour Board to improve their harbour entrance.	
	Support for the extension of Sumburgh airport runway Shetland could be developed as a transport hub due		Support for direct ferry link to Rosyth Remove some leisure facilities to	
	 to its central location Operator of Scasta Airport should be allowed to offer cheap flights to the airport 		 provide more cabin space Support for retaining Aberdeen as principal mainland port 	
North Isles CC			 Ferries could operate extra journeys during the day to alleviate overcrowding rather than sitting in port doing nothing for 12 hours 	

Consultee Suggestions: External Links

Consultee		External Transport		
Group	Air - Passenger	Air – Freight	Sea – Passenger	Sea – Freight
Whalsay and Skerries CCs			 Support for retaining Aberdeen as Shetland's main port, because Aberdeen has good onward transport connections whereas the road from Peterhead is not great, and Edinburgh Airport is not easily accessible from Rosyth. 	 An all year freight service is required, as the fish factory in Whalsay could be threatened by a lack of fish feed.
			 Support for retaining Aberdeen because if fog prevents a flight, it is easy enough to catch the NorthLink ferry. 	
Transport Operators	HIAL proactive in keeping airport open for delayed planes		Ferry could operate as a shuttle service during the summer	• There is a need for a comprehensive study into the future of the Northern
	Future new air route development plans centre on Inverness		Mixed views regarding the attraction of Rosyth	Isles ferry service.
	Support for benefits that external support of Highlands and Islands air network will bring		 LPA to spend £30m on capital projects by 2012 	
	Review of aircraft type in future due to continued growth on air routes.		More promotion of Shetland as a tourist destination	
Industry	Try to increase competition on air routes	 Introduction of freight specific air service. 		 Re-introduction of a freight user's forum with NorthLink or the successor operator.
				Designated diversionary port on the UK for the NorthLink service.
Youth Groups	Not pay fares on air services until 16		 Smyril Line boat should stop in Lerwick for longer to give passengers the chance to get off, look around and spend money 	

Appendix C - Your Voice Autumn 2005 Questionnaire

Introduction

This appendix looks at the recently completed 'Your Voice' Autumn 2005 questionnaire, and compares the questions in this related to transport with a survey completed in October 2000 by NOP. In addition some transport related results are included from the 'Your Voice' March 2005 questionnaire.

The 'Your Voice' Autumn 2005 questionnaire is the third 'Your Voice' questionnaire to have been completed by the recently created 'Your Voice Opinion Panel'. The panel contains 585 members who are representative of the population of Shetland. Approximately 49% of the panel responded to this questionnaire, equating to approximately 287 people. The survey is sent out by post, and includes a freepost envelope for responses.

The Autumn 2005 questionnaire is comparable to a survey completed by NOP in October 2000. This survey was completed by telephone with a total of 520 adult (aged 16 or over) respondents. The data used in the compilation of the report is weighted by age, sex, postcode sector and car ownership according to 1998 population statistics in order to make them as representative as possible of the residents of the islands.

Where questions in the two surveys are comparable, then the results from both are provided.

External Links

- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' 67% of respondents have made a trip out of Shetland in the last year by plane, and of the total respondents,
 - 20% have made one trip
 - o 16% have made two trips
 - 10% have made three trips
 - o 8% have made four trips
 - 3% have made five trips
 - 10% have made six or more trips

From the 'NOP October 2000' survey, in total 55% of the population have made trips out of Shetland by plane in the last year.

From NOP October 2000 survey, of those who have travelled by plane,

- 24% have made 0 trips in the last year
- o 31% have made 1 trip
- 21% have made 2 trips
- 19% have made between 3 and 5 trips
- 6% have made 6 or more trips

Note that the two surveys percentages are not directly comparable.

• From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', of those who travelled by plane for a trip in the last year, 44% travelled for pleasure, 39% to visit family or friends, 34% on business, 16% for health reasons, 13% for shopping and 2% for education.

From 'NOP October 2000' survey of those who travelled by plane for a trip in the last year, 36% travelled for pleasure, 26% to visit family and friends, 20% on business, 11% for health reasons, 6% for shopping, and 3% for education.

- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey 42% of people aged 65+ had travelled out of Shetland by plane and 91% of respondents aged 16-24 had travelled out of Shetland by plane
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey 63% of respondents had made a trip out of Shetland by ferry, and of the total number of respondents,
 - o 24% have made one trip
 - o 19% have made two trips
 - 7% have made three trips
 - 6% have made four trips
 - o 2% have made five trips
 - 5% have made six or more trips

From the 'NOP October 2000' survey, in total 45% of those who had travelled out of Shetland in the last 12 months did so by ferry

From NOP October 2000 survey, of those who have travelled by ferry

- o 41% have made 0 trips in the last year
- o 35% have made 1 trip
- o 13% have made 2 trips
- 9% have made between 3 and 5 trips
- 2% have made 6 or more trips

Note that the two surveys percentages are not directly comparable in this case.

• From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey, of those who travelled by ferry for a trip in the last year, 61% travelled for pleasure, 37% for visiting family and friends, 15% for business, 15% for shopping, 4% for health reasons and 3% for education

From 'NOP October 2000' survey, of those who travelled by ferry for a trip in the last year 48% travelled for pleasure, 24% to visit family and friends, 13% on business, 6% for health reasons, 7% for shopping and 3% for education

- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey 46% of people aged 55+ and 73% of people aged 16-24 had travelled out of Shetland by ferry
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', of those travelling by plane
 - o 14% did so because it was cheaper
 - 25% because the times were more convenient
 - 17% don't like the sea crossing
 - o 67% because it is faster
 - o 10% because there was a special offer
 - 13% because it was more comfortable
 - o 6% for another reason

From 'NOP October 2000', of those who have travelled by plane in the last 12 months

- o 12% did so because it was cheaper than the ferry
- o 24% because there were more convenient times
- o 13% because they don't like sailing
- o 59% because it is faster than the ferry
- 12% because it is more comfortable
- 14% for another reason
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', of those travelling by ferry
 - o 50% did so because it was cheaper

- 15% because of more convenient times
- o 1% because it was faster
- o 3% because there was a special offer
- 4% because it was more comfortable
- 3% because they don't like flying
- o 2% didn't know
- 38% for another reason

From 'NOP October 2000', of those who have travelled by plane in the last 12 months

- 37% did so because it was cheaper then flying
- \circ 24 % because there were more convenient times
- o 5% because it was more comfortable
- 6% because they don't like flying
- o 19% to take the car
- o 16% for another reason
- 1% didn't know
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', 62% of respondents paid full fare, 33% received a discount and 5% couldn't remember on their last trip outside Shetland

From 'NOP October 2000', 45% of respondents paid full fare, 52% paid a reduced fare and 3% didn't know

• From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', 77% of respondents paid for the trip themselves, 23% had it paid for by someone else and 1% didn't know or couldn't remember

From 'NOP October 2000', 76% paid the fare themselves, and the remainder had someone else pay the fare

- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', people travelled to the following destinations:
 - Aberdeen 33%
 - o Other UK 23%
 - Outside the UK 13%
 - Other Scotland 10%
 - o Glasgow 8%
 - o London 3%
 - o Inverness 2%

From 'NOP October 2000', people travelled to the following destinations

- Aberdeen 31%
- Edinburgh 9%
- Glasgow 6%
- Inverness 1%
- Other Scotland 13%
- London 4%
- o Other UK 19%
- Outside the UK 16%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', people travelled to the airport/ ferry terminal travel by the following mode of transport
 - Car driver 46%
 - Car passenger 31%
 - o Taxi 4%
 - o Ferry 3%

- o Bus 2%
- Walked 1%
- Motorbike 1%
- o Other 1%

From 'NOP October 2000', people travelled to the airport/ ferry terminal travel by the following modes of transport

- Car driver 41%
- Car passenger 39%
- o Bus 10%
- o Taxi 7%
- Walked 3%
- o Other 1%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', people travelling from the airport/ ferry terminal by the following mode of transport
 - Car driver 43%
 - Car passenger 27%
 - Taxi 9%
 - o Ferry 2%
 - Bus 3%
 - Motorbike 1%
 - o Other 1%

From 'NOP October 2000', people travelled from the airport/ ferry terminal travel by the following modes of transport

- o Car driver 19%
- Car passenger 25%
- o Bus 15%
- o Taxi 25%
- o Walked 6%
- o Train 6%
- o Plane 3%
- o Other 1%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey for people travelling by plane, the reason for choosing this mode of transport to reach the airport was
 - Convenient/ easy 66%
 - o Cost 7%
 - Only way known 4%
 - Speed 15%
 - No other option 22%
 - o Other 3%

From 'NOP October 2000' survey for people travelling by plane the reason for choosing this mode of transport to reach the airport was

- Convenient/ easy 61%
- Cost 16%
- No other option 19%
- o Speed 25%
- Only way known 4%
- o Other 4%

- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey for people travelling by ferry, the reason for choosing this mode of transport to reach the ferry terminal was
 - Convenient/ easy 57%
 - o Cost 22%
 - Only way know 6%
 - Don't know 1%
 - Speed 3%
 - No other option 15%
 - Other 14%

From 'NOP October 2000' survey for people travelling by plane the reason for choosing this mode of transport to reach the ferry terminal was

- Convenient/ easy 62%
- o Cost 23%
- No other option 18%
- Speed 4%
- Only way known 5%
- Other 6%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey, while travelling, the following problems were encountered
 - No problems or delays 72%
 - Delays/ traffic jams 4%
 - Cancellations 2%
 - Missed transport 1%
 - No connecting transport 1%

From 'NOP October 2000' survey during while travelling, the following problems were encountered

- Delays/ traffic jams 11%
- o Cancellations 1%
- No connecting services 1%
- o Other 8%
- No difficulties or delays 79%
- From the 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey the reasons that the 33% (approx) of people who did not travel out of Shetland are
 - Had no need to 44%
 - Had no wish to 32%
 - Could not afford it 24%
 - Can't travel (too old/ disabled) 12%
 - No time to travel 12%
 - Other reason 6%

From the 'NOP October 2000' survey the reasons that people who did not travel out of Shetland gave for not travelling were:

- Had no need to 50%
- Could not afford it 32%
- Had no wish to travel 22%
- Had no time to travel 10%
- Can't travel (disabled/ too old etc) 6%
- Some other reason 2%

• From the 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey, of those who have not travelled off Shetland in the previous 12 months, 53% were planning to travel off Shetland in the next 12 months, 20% weren't and 27% were undecided

From the 'NOP October 2000' survey, of those who had not travelled off Shetland in the previous 12 months, 51% were planning to travel off Shetland in the next 12 months, 42% weren't and 7% were undecided

- From the 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey, anticipated destinations for travel in the next 12 months were, for those who had not travelled in the previous 12 months
 - o Aberdeen 33%
 - Other Scotland 17%
 - Outside UK 11%
 - London 11%
 - Don't know 11%
 - Inverness 6%
 - Glasgow 6%
 - Other UK 6%

From the 'NOP October 2000' survey, anticipated destinations for travel in the next 12 months were, for those who had not travelled in the previous 12 months

- o Aberdeen 27%
- o Glasgow 11%
- Edinburgh 8%
- o Inverness 1%
- Other Scotland 5%
- London 4%
- o Other UK 19%
- Outside the UK 10%
- Other 3%
- o Don't know 14%
- From the 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey, for those who had not travelled in the previous 12 months, 47% of respondents said they would be likely to use the plane, 37% the ferry and the remainder were undecided

From the 'NOP October 2000' survey, for those who had not travelled in the previous12 months, 42% of respondents said they would be likely to use the plane, 51% the ferry and the remaining 7% were undecided

- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005' survey, the reasons for selecting that mode for those travelling by plane were:
 - Cheaper 11%
 - More convenient times 11%
 - o Other 22%
 - Faster 78%
 - More comfortable 22%
 - Don't like sea crossing 22%

From 'NOP October 2000' survey, the reasons for selecting that mode for those travelling by plane were:

- Cheaper than ferry 9%
- Faster then ferry 60%
- More convenient times 26%
- Don't like sailing 10%

- More comfortable then ferry 2%
- o Other 10%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', the reasons given for selecting the ferry were:
 - Cheaper 85%
 - More convenient times 14%
 - Faster 14%

From 'NOP October 2000', the reasons given for taking the ferry were

- Cheaper 59%
- More convenient times 9%
- Faster 2%
- Don't like flying 20%
- More comfortable 10%
- o Other 27%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', the preferred destination when flying from Shetland was given as:
 - Aberdeen 56%
 - o Glasgow 19%
 - Edinburgh 12%
 - Inverness 7%
 - Don't know 7%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', a fair price for a flexible return ticket to Aberdeen or Inverness by air was considered to be:
 - Up to £50 16%
 - £50 £70 6%
 - £70 £80 23%
 - o £90 £100 22%
 - £100 + 10%
 - o Don't know 20%

From 'NOP October 2000', a fair price for a flight to Aberdeen or Inverness would be

- Up to £50 7%
- o £51 £70 10%
- £71 £80 9%
- £81 £90 6%
- £91 £1000 29%
- £101 £150 12%
- £151 + 4%
- Don't know 23%
- From 'Your Voice 2005', a fair price for the cheapest flexible return ticket to Aberdeen by ferry would be:
 - Up to £50 46%
 - £50 £100 19%
 - Don't know 32%

From 'NOP 2000', a fair price for a return ticket to Aberdeen by sea would be

- Up to £50 26%
- £51 £70 17%
- £71 £80 11%
- £81 £100 17%
- £101 £150 5%

- o £151+1%
- Don't know 24%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', a fair price for a flexible return ticket to Edinburgh or Glasgow by air was considered to be:
 - Up to £70 11%
 - £70 £100 31%
 - £100 + 25%
 - Don't know 29%

From 'NOP October 2000', a fair price for a return flight to Edinburgh or Glasgow was thought to be

- Up to £50 2%
- £51 £70 4%
- £71 £80 5%
- £81 £100 17%
- £101 £120 10%
- £121 £150 21%
- o £151+8%
- Don't know 32%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', A fair price for a flexible return ticket to London by air was considered to be:
 - Up to £100 20%
 - £100 £150 28%
 - £160 + 16%
 - Don't know 33%

From 'NOP October 2000', a fair price for a return flight to London was thought to be

- £51 £70 1%
- £71 £80 1%
- £81 £100 10%
- £101 £150 23%
- o £151+32%
- Don't know 33%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', the number of people that would prefer Rosyth as a final destination, assuming the cost and journey times were the same are:
 - o Rosyth 25%
 - Aberdeen 55%
 - Don't know 20%

A similar question was asked in the 'NOP October 2000' survey, asking respondents where their ideal destination on the mainland would be

- Aberdeen 67%
- Edinburgh 11%
- o Glasgow 6%
- Inverness 1%
- o Other 10%
- Don't know 5%

Internal Links

- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', people travel by the following modes of transport to work:
 - Car 66%
 - Walk 11%
 - o Bus 6%
 - o Ferry 4%
 - Other 3%
 - Motorcycle 1%
 - o Taxi 1%
 - o Bicycle 1%

From 'NOP' October 2000, people travel to work by the following modes of transport

- o Car 70%
- o Walk 22%
- o Bus 8%
- o Taxi 2%
- Motorcycle 1%
- Bicycle 1%
- o Boat 1%
- o Other 4%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', school aged children travel to and from school by:
 - School bus 43%
 - o Car 23%
 - Walk 20%
 - o Taxi 5%
 - Other bus 4%
 - o Other 2%
 - Cycle 1%
 - Ferry 1%

From 'NOP October 2000, school aged children travel to and from school by:

- School bus 48%
- o Walk 36%
- o Car 21%
- Other bus 4%
- Lift from friend 4%
- Cycle 2%
- o Taxi 2%
- o Other 1%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', the transport issues that are most important for the council to tackle are:
 - Parking 39%
 - Accident reduction 36%
 - Public transport 33%
 - o None 24%
 - Road repairs 22%
 - Don't know 8%
 - Road improvements 4%
 - Cycling 3%

- From 'NOP October 2000', the transport issues that are most important for the council to tackle are:
 - Public transport 52%
 - Road repairs 31%
 - Parking 30%
 - Road improvements 26%
 - o Accident reduction 25%
 - Cycling 12%
 - o Don't know 2%
 - o None 1%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', 24% of households had one person with a driving licence, 58% have two, the remaining 18% have three or more
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', 37% of households have access to one car or van, 48% to two and 15% to three or more
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', in order to reach a health care appointment:
 - Car 84%
 - o Walk 15%
 - o Taxi 6%
 - o Bus 6%
 - Ferry 4%
 - o Cycle 2%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', people use local bus services at the following frequencies:
 - o Daily 3%
 - o Weekly 8%
 - o Monthly 3%
 - Less frequent 38%
 - Never 47%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', people use taxi hire
 - o Daily 1%
 - o Weekly 5%
 - Monthly 12%
 - Less frequent 41%
 - Never 40%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', the following table rates the local bus service (more than 1/3 respondents were unable to rate the bus service)

	Good	ОК	Poor	Don't Know/No Opinion
Comfort	28%	29%	7%	36%
Safety	35%	28%	2%	35%
Provision for Children/ Shopping	21%	29%	28%	42%
Provision for elderly/ disabled	24%	28%	8%	22%
Boarding point close to home	30%	25%	14%	31%
Journey times	25%	35%	6%	24%
Links to other services	13%	25%	16%	48%
Return services	19%	29%	14%	39%

Reliable services	35%	28%	1%	36%
Frequency of evening services	4%	13%	41%	43%
Frequency of weekend services	7%	17%	32%	44%
Frequency of day time services	15%	28%	20%	37%
Route end destinations	15%	37%	6%	42%
Cost	24%	37%	1%	38%

• From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', the following table shows how people rate SIC's roads maintenance operation

	Very Poor	Poor	Satisfactory	Good	Excellent
Repair of pot holes and road surface defects	8%	22%	47%	16%	7%
General standard of road surface	2%	13%	42%	29%	15%
Road markings	3%	10%	44%	32%	10%
Roadside drainage, ditches and gullies	7%	13%	45%	29%	6%
Road signs	1%	7%	49%	33%	9%
General standard of footway maintenance	6%	15%	49%	23%	6%
Frequency of cutting of grass verges	7%	22%	42%	23%	5%
Extent of verges cut throughout the summer	11%	19%	44%	21%	6%

• From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', the following table shows how people rate SIC's snow clearing and gritting operation

	Very Poor	Poor	Satisfactory	Good	Excellent
Rural main roads	4%	8%	40%	36%	13%
Rural minor roads	12%	22%	39%	21%	6%
Main roads in Lerwick	1%	4%	32%	40%	23%
Minor roads in Lerwick	2%	13%	38%	33%	13%
Residential areas/ Housing scheme roads	4%	29%	45%	24%	6%
Main footways in Lerwick	5%	14%	39%	30%	12%
Footways in residential areas	13%	16%	44%	20%	8%
Provision of grit bins	5%	18%	44%	27%	7%

• From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', the following table rates SIC's street lighting provision and maintenance

	Very Poor	Poor	Satisfactory	Good	Excellent
Speed of repairs of street lights	2%	5%	53%	30%	10%
Level of lighting provided	2%	4%	47%	37%	11%
Extent of street lighting provided	2%	5%	47%	37%	9%

- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', the following are ranked in order of priority based on responses with their scores
 - Take more measures to reduce road accidents 7.70
 - o Improve winter service by continuing to grit roads later in the evening 7.28
 - o Increase car parking provision in Lerwick 6.57
 - o Improvement of minor roads, but keeping them single track 6.51
 - Increase footway provision in rural areas 6.47
 - Upgrading of single track roads to double width 5.99
 - Improve winter service by gritting more footways 5.93
 - Increase provision of traffic calming measures 5.74
 - Provision of cycle paths 5.32
 - Secure cycle storage or cycle racks in Lerwick 4.09

The previous 'Your Voice' survey was completed in March 2005. There are no directly comparable questions between the autumn 2005 survey and the March 2005 survey. However the following questions relate to transport, or had answers that relate to transport.

Inter-Island Links

- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', people use the inter island ferry service
 - Daily 3%
 - Weekly 13%
 - Monthly 16%
 - Less frequent 57%
 - Never 11%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', people use the inter island air service
 - Daily 0%
 - Weekly 0%
 - o Monthly 0%
 - Less frequent 15%
 - o Never 84%
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', the following table rate the inter island ferry service (45% of respondents were unable to rate the ferry service)

	Good	ОК	Poor	Don't Know/No Opinion
Comfort	62%	22%	2%	15%
Safety	65%	18%	2%	15%
Provision for Children/ Shopping	35%	23%	5%	37%
Provision for elderly/ disabled	31%	30%	8%	31%
Boarding point close to home	31%	35%	8%	36%
Journey times	44%	36%	2%	18%
Links to other services	21%	28%	7%	44%
Return services	39%	36%	2%	22%
Reliable services	45%	33%	3%	19%
Frequency of evening services	26%	23%	7%	45%
Frequency of weekend services	29%	24%	6%	41%
Frequency of day time services	41%	27%	2%	30%
Route end destinations	32%	32%	2%	34%
Cost	33%	38%	11%	19%

• From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', the following table rates the inter island air service (84% of respondents were unable to rate the air service)

	Good	ОК	Poor	Don't Know/No Opinion
Comfort	7%	14%	2%	78%
Safety	16%	6%	1%	77%
Provision for Children/ Shopping	4%	5%	4%	86%
Provision for elderly/ disabled	5%	4%	7%	83%
Boarding point close to home	5%	10%	5%	80%
Journey times	10%	11%	1%	78%
Links to other services	6%	7%	5%	82%
Return services	9%	10%	2%	80%
Reliable services	8%	9%	5%	78%
Frequency of evening services	1%	3%	9%	88%
Frequency of weekend services	2%	3%	9%	86%
Frequency of day time services	3%	12%	2%	83%
Route end destinations	7%	9%	2%	83%
Cost	3%	9%	8%	80%

General Issues

- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', when asked 'What are you mad about for Shetland?'
 - \circ ~ 13% of respondents stated Costs/ cost of travel
 - 4% of respondents answered 'Transport/ fuel
 - 1% of respondents answered 'Bressay Bridge'
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', when asked 'What are you sad about for Shetland?'
 - o 3% of respondents answered 'Travel/costs'
 - 1% stated Bad driving/ driving offences/ drink driving
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', when asked 'What are you glad about for Shetland?'
 - 1% stated 'Excellent transport links'
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', when asked 'If you had absolute authority over Shetland what would you do to improve the quality of life for everyone that lives there?'
 - A common theme was the reduction in costs of transport both to and from the isles on both planes and ferries and within the isles through both cheaper petrol and road tax
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', when asked 'If you could change one thing, what would it be?'
 - A large proportion of respondents indicated that it would be cheaper travel costs both to and from the islands and within the islands
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', ideas to reduce the transport energy demands included:
 - The promotion of car sharing schemes
 - Discourage people from using large 4 wheel drive cars that consume large amounts of fuel

- Encourage home working
- Encourage people to live more centrally for example in Lerwick rather than on outlying islands
- Increase use of cargo boats rather than bulk lorries to transport fish feed for instance
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', 48% of residents thought that it was easy to get where they want, when they want in Shetland
- From 'Your Voice Autumn 2005', when asked how more could be done for those that don't have access to a car:
 - Better public transport and feeder services
 - More retirement houses along bus route. Most people have to tackle a steep road once off the bus
 - Ask people if bus timetables are working, support facilities in communities
 - Do not centralise
 - Car sharing
 - Better, more regular public transport. 'Ring + Ride' for disabled/ elderly/ parents of young children
 - o Provide community based minibuses for rural areas
 - Spend more on buses and less on ferries
 - Improve bus services which at the moment limit people for employment (i.e. early or late shifts)
 - Better bus shelters
 - Empower them to live in Lerwick where they will have access to buses, employment, education and childcare
 - Community car schemes car owners volunteering to drive others at little or no cost to anywhere within say 10 miles of their home

Summary

The above details the findings of two surveys conducted of the previous 5 years which examine transportation trends in Shetland. In addition, extracts are taken from a third survey, the March 2005 'Your Voice' questionnaire. These surveys both show the opinion of the people of Shetland to the transport issues that affect them, and, in a great many cases, how this opinion has changed over the period 2000 - 2005.

Appendix D: Sample Letter to Parliamentary Representatives

15 November 2005

Our Ref: 43837TGLT

Dear,

Subject: Shetland Transport Strategy Consultation

Shetland Islands Council are currently undergoing the process of preparing their Transport Strategy. Faber Maunsell have been commissioned to provide assistance to the Council on this piece of work. We have started to undertake a consultation process across Shetland which involves speaking to key stakeholders.

In the preparation of the Transport Strategy, consideration is being given to three key areas relating to transport provision in Shetland. The first of these relates to internal transport, for example bus services in key areas. The second area under consideration are the inter-island links within Shetland. These include inter-island air and ferry services, as well as fixed links. The final area being considered is external transport, the links between Shetland and the rest of Scotland, Europe and Scandinavia. We are taking into account not only the transportation of people, but also the transportation of freight and livestock.

As part of this consultation process, we would like to offer you the opportunity to express your views on the three areas of transport provision mentioned above. If you wish to prepare your comments by letter we would be delighted to receive these at the above address. Alternatively, we would be equally happy to discuss these issues by telephone, or to arrange to meet with you.

Should you have any queries relating to this consultation, please do not hesitate to contact me at our Aberdeen office on the details below.

I would like to take this opportunity to thank you in advance for your comments on these issues.

Yours sincerely

Paul Finch Principal Consultant T +44 (0)1224 224 650 F +44 (0)1224 224 651 E paul.finch@fabermaunsell.com

Appendix E: Library Van Questionnaire

Shetland Transport Strategy – Library Van Questionnaire

Local Trips

1. How do you normally travel around your area? Do you walk, use buses, community transport, taxi, drive by car or recieve lifts by car?

2. Have you experienced any problems or difficulties with any of these types of transport? Can you provide any examples?

3. Are there any ways that the bus service could be improved in your area?

4. Are there any ways that walking could be made safer or easier in your area?

5. Are there any problems related to roads and car-use in your area (i.e. dangerous roads)?

Inter-Island Trips

- 1. Do you use the inter-islands ferry or air services?
- 2. What do you use the inter-islands ferry or air services for meeting with friends and family, day-trips out, shopping?

3. Have you ever experienced any problems or difficulties travelling on the inter-islands ferry or air services? Can you provide examples?

4. What would you like to see improved on the inter-islands ferry and air services?

Trips to Scottish Mainland

1. Do you travel to the Scottish Mainland using the ferry or the plane services?

2. For what reasons do you typically travel to the Scottish Mainland – meeting with friends and family, holidays, shopping, hospital visits?

3. Have you ever experienced any problems or difficulties travelling on the air or ferry services to Scotland Mainland? If so, please explain the problems that you had?

4. What would you like to see improved on the air and ferry services to Scotland Mainland?

Appendix F: SIC Website Questionnaire

Shetland Transport Strategy – Have Your Say Questionnaire

Inter-island Links

As part of the process of understanding current and future issues for the Shetland Transport Strategy, we are looking to hear views on the current **inter-islands links** and some potential options for the future maintenance and development of these links.

1. How are the inter-islands links currently used? How often, and for what purpose (i.e. commuting to work, shopping) do you use the inter-islands ferry and air services?

2. Do the inter-islands ferry and air services meet your requirements? If not, please explain why.

3. What are the current strengths and weaknesses of the inter-islands ferry and air services?

4. How would you like to see the inter-islands ferry and air services improved in the short to medium-term?

5. How would you like to see the inter-islands ferry and air services improved in the medium to long-term?

Have Your Say – External Links

As part of the process of understanding current and future issues for the Shetland Transport Strategy, we are looking to hear views on the current **external links** provision to the Shetland Islands, both by air and ferry, and some potential options for the future maintenance and development of these links.

1. How do you currently use external links to and from the Shetland Islands? How regularly and for what purpose (i.e. business, leisure, shopping) do you use the external transport services? Please provide examples both for the air service and the ferry service.

2. Do Shetland's external transport services (air and ferry) meet your requirements? If not, please state why.

3. In you opinion, what are the current strengths and weaknesses of external transport links to and from the Shetland Islands? Again, please provide examples both for air and ferry services.

4. How would you like to see external transport links to the islands improved in the short to medium-term? Please provide examples both for air and ferry services.

5. How would you like to see external transport links to the islands improved in the medium to long-term? Please provide examples both for air and ferry services.

Have Your Say... Internal Transport Services

As part of the process of understanding current and future issues for the Shetland Transport Strategy, we are looking to hear views on the current provision of **internal transport services** in Shetland (i.e. public transport, roads, walking and cycling opportunities) and some potential options for the future maintenance and development of these services.

1. How do you currently travel around your area? How regularly and for what purpose (i.e. commuting to work, shopping) do you travel and what modes do you use (i.e. public transport, community transport, taxi, private car, informal lifts, walk/cycle)?

2. Do the available public transport services in your area meet your requirements? If not, please state why.

3. Are there adequate walking and cycling facilities provided in your area (i.e. footpaths, cycle paths, crossing opportunities, traffic calming etc)?

4. Are there any issues related to roads, and car-use in your area (i.e. dangerous roads) that you think we should be aware of?

5. In you opinion, what are the current strengths and weaknesses of public transport in your area?

6. How would you like to see the management of local roads, delivery of public transport services and/or delivery of pedestrian/cycle facilities improved in the short to medium-term?

7. How would you like to see the management of local roads, delivery of public transport services and/or delivery of pedestrian/cycle facilities improved in the medium to long-term?

Prepared by:	Approved by:
Richie Fraser	Paul Finch
Consultant	Principal Consultant

Consultation Report

Rev No	Comments	Date
1		

Riverside House, Riverside Drive, Aberdeen, AB11 7LH Telephone: 01224 224650 Fax: 01224 224301 Website: http://www.fabermaunsell.com

Job No 43837TGLT Reference 11

Date Created March 2006

This contains confidential and commercially sensitive information, which shall not be disclosed to third parties.

c:\fabermaunsell abz\projects\shetland rts\11\initial consultation\summary consultation report\shetland consultation report - summary pf.doc